



सत्यमेव जयते



Empowered lives.
Resilient nations.



MONITORING NATIONAL PLAN TARGETS: STATUS OF DATA AVAILABILITY

Human Development: Towards Bridging Inequalities
Government of India-UNDP Project on Human Development

Prepared by G.D. Sharma

© Planning Commission, GOI - UNDP 2013.
All Rights Reserved. Published in India.

**MONITORING NATIONAL PLAN TARGETS:
STATUS OF DATA AVAILABILITY**

2013



T.K. Pandey
Joint Secretary (State Plans) &
National Project Director (HDBI)

सत्यमेव जयते



भारत सरकार
योजना आयोग
योजना भवन
नई दिल्ली-110 001

GOVERNMENT OF INDIA
PLANNING COMMISSION
YOJANA BHAWAN
NEW DELHI-110 001

FOREWORD

The study on "Monitoring National Plan Targets: Status of Data Availability" was commissioned in 2012-13 under the ongoing Planning Commission - UNDP Project on "Human Development - Towards Bridging Inequalities. It focused on availability of data on the 27 monitorable targets of the 11th Five Year Plan under six major categories namely, income and poverty, education, health, women and children, infrastructure and environment at national level. The outcome of the study is the Base paper which attempts to map the availability of data and highlight the gaps that exist in monitoring plan targets.

Improvement of statistical system is a continuous process and is an essential requirement for a robust planning process. This Base paper is presented to the Ministries and Departments of National and State Governments to provide ready information on data availability and gaps in respect of some important monitorable targets of Five Year Plans.

The 12th Plan has 25 monitorable targets and several targets are similar to those of 11th Plan. An update of the Base paper for the 12th Plan targets is also being planned under the Project and will be available soon. In the meanwhile, it is hoped that this Base paper would prove useful for taking steps to plug data gaps.

(T.K. Pandey)

Joint Secretary (State Plans) & National Project Director GOI-UNDP Project on
Human Development towards Bridging Inequalities





MESSAGE

The aim of this important paper is to contribute to outcome-based planning and budgeting by analysing the availability of the data which can be used to monitor targets in India's recent Eleventh Five Year Plan.

The paper shows that reliable data is available for most of the national targets and all of the target indicators at the state level. The paper also makes the case that key targets should be frequently updated and that disaggregated data by district, gender and social group is still lacking for a number of income, poverty and health indicators.

Periodic and reliable monitoring of progress against targets is key for knowing whether national plans are on track. Making sure the right kind of updated data is available is a necessary and important part of the major efforts being made in India to monitor the impact of government schemes and missions and ensure that public resources are being used effectively and efficiently.

UNDP India is honoured to support this process through technical assistance. We wish to congratulate the Planning Commission for this paper and express our gratitude to the divisions within the Planning Commission which provided support and inputs.

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read 'Lise Grande', is centered on the page.

Lise Grande

United Nations Resident Coordinator
Resident Representative United Nations Development Programme



LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

AICTE	All India Council for Technical Education
BSLLD	Basic Statistics for Local Level Development
CDS	Current Daily Status
CPCB	Central Pollution Control Board
CSO	Central Statistics Office
DC-SSI	Development Commissioner- Small Scale Industries
DC-MSME	Development Commissioner- Micro, Small and Medium Enterprises
DES	Directorate of Economics and Statistics
DGET	Directorate General of Employment and Training
DISE	District Information System on Education
DLHS	District Level Household Survey
DSO	District Statistics Office
GDP	Gross Domestic Product
GER	Gross Enrollment Ratio
GSDP/SDP	Gross State Domestic Product/State Domestic Product
GVA	Gross Value Added
HD	Human Development
HLSC	High Level Steering Committee
ICPS	Integrated Child Protection Scheme
ICT	Information and Communications Technology
IMR	Infant Mortality Rate
ISIC	International Standard Industrial Classification
ISSP	Indian Statistical Strengthening Project
KVIC	Khadi and Village Industries Commission
LoP	Letter of Participation
LR	Live Register
MDGs	Millennium Development Goals
MHRD	Ministry of Human Resource Development
MMR	Maternal Mortality Rate
MoEF	Ministry of Environment and Forestry
MoHFW	Ministry of Health and Family Welfare
MoHUPA	Ministry of Housing and Urban Poverty Alleviation



MoSPI	Ministry of Statistics and Programme Implementation
MoRD	Ministry of Rural Development
MoU	Memorandum of Understanding
MRP	Mixed Recall Period
MWCD	Ministry of Women and Child Development
NDP	Net Domestic Product
NER	Net Enrollment Ratio
NFHS	National Family Health Survey
NGO	Non-Governmental Organisation
NIC	National Industrial Classification
NSDP	Net State Domestic Product
NSDRPA	National Watershed Development Project for Rainfed Areas
NSO	National Statistical Organisation
NSSO	National Sample Survey Organisation
NSSP	National Strategic Statistical Plan
NUEPA	National University of Educational Planning and Administration
PMGSY	PradhanMantry Gram Sadak Yojana
PMRY	Prime Minister's Rozgar Yojana
REGP	Rural Employment Generation Programme
SC	Scheduled Caste
SGRY	Sampoorna Gramin Rozgar Yojana
SGSY	Swarna Jayanti Gram Swarozgar Yojana
SMEs	Small and Medium Enterprises
SNA	System of National Accounts
SRS	Sample Registration System
SSSP	State Strategic Statistical Plans
ST	Scheduled Tribe
RGI	Registrar General of India
UGC	University Grants Commission
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
VPT	Village Public Telephone
WHO	World Health Organisation



Monitorable Socio-Economic Targets of the XIth Plan

The 27 National Targets

Twenty seven targets at the national level fall in six major categories. The six categories are: (a) Income and Poverty; (b) Education; (c) Health; (d) Women and Children; (e) Infrastructure; and (f) Environment. The targets in each of these categories are given below:

(a) Income & Poverty

- (i) Average GDP growth rate of 9% per year in the Eleventh Plan period
- (ii) Agricultural GDP growth rate at 4% per year on the average
- (iii) Generation of 58 million new work opportunities
- (iv) Reduction of unemployment among the educated to less than 5%
- (v) Twenty percent rise in the real wage rate of unskilled workers
- (vi) Reduction in the headcount ratio of consumption poverty by 10 percentage points

(b) Education

- (i) Reduction in the drop out rates of children from elementary school from 52.2% in 2003-04 to 20% by 2011-12, that is by the end of the Eleventh Plan
- (ii) Developing minimum standards of educational attainment in elementary schools, to ensure quality education
- (iii) Increasing the literacy rate for persons of age 7 years or more to 85% by 2011-12.
- (iv) Lowering the gender gap in literacy to 10 percentage points by 2011-12
- (v) Increasing the percentage of each cohort going to higher education from the present 10% to 15% by 2011-12

(c) Health

- (i) Infant mortality rate (IMR) to be reduced to 28 and maternal mortality ratio (MMR) to 1 per 1000 live births by the end of the Eleventh Plan
- (ii) Total Fertility Rate to be reduced to 2.1 by the end of the Eleventh Plan
- (iii) Clean drinking water to be available for all by 2009, ensuring that there are no slip-backs by the end of the Eleventh Plan
- (iv) Malnutrition among children of age group 0-3 to be reduced to half its present level by the end of the Eleventh Plan
- (v) Anemia among women and girls to be reduced to half its present level by the end of the Eleventh Plan

(d) Women and Children

- (i) Sex ratio for age group 0-6 to be raised to 935 by 2011-12 and to 950 by 2016-17
- (ii) Ensuring that at least 33 percent of the direct and indirect beneficiaries of all government schemes are women and girl children
- (iii) To ensure that all children enjoy a safe childhood, without any compulsion to work



(e) Infrastructure

- (i) To ensure electricity connection to all villages and BPL households by 2009 and round the-clock power by the end of the Plan
- (ii) To ensure all weather road connection to all habitations with population 1000 and above (500 in hilly and tribal areas) by 2009, and ensure coverage of all significant habitations by 2015
- (iii) To connect every village by telephone by November 2007 and provide broadband connectivity to all villages by 2012
- (iv) To provide homestead sites to all by 2012 and step up the pace of house construction for rural poor to cover all the poor by 2016-17

(f) Environment

- (i) To increase forest and tree cover by 5 percentage points
- (ii) To attain WHO standards of air quality in all major cities by 2011-12
- (iii) To treat all urban waste water by 2011-12 to clean river waters
- (iv) To increase energy efficiency by 20 percentage points by 2016-17

The 13 State Level Targets

The Eleventh Plan has been formulated in a manner whereby 13 of the 27 monitorable national targets have been disaggregated into appropriate targets for individual States. These are

- (a) GDP Growth rate
- (b) Agricultural growth rate
- (c) New work opportunities
- (d) Poverty ratio
- (e) Drop out rate in elementary schools
- (f) Literacy rate
- (g) Gender gap in literacy rate
- (h) Infant mortality rate (IMR)
- (i) Maternal mortality ratio (MMR)
- (j) Total Fertility Rate (TFR)
- (k) Child malnutrition
- (l) Anemia among women and girls
- (m) Sex-ratio

Appropriate policies and programmes have to be identified both at the Central and State levels so as to ensure realisation of these targets in the Eleventh Plan period.





Monitoring National Plan Targets: Status of Data Availability

An Overview

This study was commissioned to gauge the availability of reliable data on the monitorable targets in the National Plan at National and State levels. The study presents an analysis of data availability for all National and State level targets included in the XIth Five Year Plan document and acts as a ready reference to those seeking to monitor progress. By mapping the availability of data, it also highlights the gaps that exist in monitoring Plan targets. Since the data gaps have been identified, attempts may be made to add specific indicators to the planned surveys by MOSPI/RGI/NFHS which will go a long way in building the ability of the Planning Commission and line ministries to monitor Plan targets.

Background

Timely availability of reliable and valid data is an essential pre-requisite for any planning, designing and monitoring cycle. The relevance of statistics for governments is heightened because statistical data forms the basis of planning and policy formulation. Proper allocation of resources to schemes that impact the lives of millions is dependent upon the availability of reliable, valid and timely data.

India has a statistical system that is fairly robust in generating National Accounts statistics at the National and State level. However, with a shift in the development paradigm from one that underscored the importance of economic growth as the end all of development to human development that States that economic growth is merely a means to a plurality of outcomes that people cherish, an increased demand is being posed on the statistical systems for generating statistics on indicators beyond National Accounts. The challenge that the statistical system faces today is compounded by the requirements of decentralised planning and policy emphasis on inclusion.

Planning cycles in India are asynchronous with data generation cycles. As a result while Plans set monitorable targets, there is no adequate system to monitor them. This is true of monitorable targets at the National and State level as well as the visioning exercise done for district planning.

This study was initiated in 2012 to analyse data availability and prepare a paper on the status of availability of reliable, timely and valid data on monitorable targets in the XI Five Year Plan and to identify gaps in availability of the data. The overall goal of the exercise is to provide pointers to plug data gaps to facilitate better monitoring of Plan targets.

The purpose of this exercise is to: indicate availability of statistics for each of the indicators highlighting the data source(s), methodology, level of disaggregation (geographical, gender, social), frequency of updation, reliability and validity, as well as comparability across States.

Key Findings

At the National level, while reliable data on most monitorable targets is available and regularly updated, a lack of frequent updation has been observed for targets such as 'generation of 58million new work opportunities' which was undertaken only as a one-time exercise, and 'literacy rates' and 'sex ratio' which depend on the decadal Census data. Other targets that depend on National Sample Survey Organisation (NSSO) data such as a reduction in the head-count ratio of consumption poverty, availability of clean drinking water, etc. are updated only once in five years and those dependent on National Family Health Survey (NFHS) data such as malnutrition among children of age-group 0-3yrs, are not periodically updated (the most recent round of the NFHS was conducted in 2005-06). This places limitations to the availability of data to monitor progress during the Plan period and make mid-cycle alterations to activities for better results. Another grave issue observed is the lack of data that is disaggregated by State/gender/social group for some of the critical indicators of progress in terms of 'income and poverty', 'education', 'health' and infrastructure. Such disaggregation is imperative in order to trace the real impact of development policies and programmes, correct imbalances and ensure progress for all.

Wherever relevant, inter-State comparisons are possible for almost all indicators where data is disaggregated at the State level through National surveys, except for some indicators such as:

- 'generation of 58million new work opportunities',
- 'developing minimum standards of education attainment in elementary schools',
- 'ensuring that at least 33% of the direct and indirect beneficiaries of all government schemes are women and girl children,' and,
- 'ensuring that all children enjoy a safe childhood, without any compulsion to work'.

Data on 'ensuring that at least 33% of the direct and indirect beneficiaries of all government schemes are women and girl children' and 'ensuring that all children enjoy a safe childhood, without any compulsion to work' has been found to be unavailable- the former could be due to the lack of consolidated information on all schemes in a single place, and the latter could be attributed to the difficulty in quantifying a loosely defined target.

With regard to State level targets, the study found that reliable data exists on all target indicators, but the frequency of updation is inadequate for the same indicators that were highlighted at the National level. Disaggregation by district/gender/social group is not available for all 'income and poverty' indicators and 'health' indicators.

A glance at the indicators used for monitoring the XII Plan targets reveals that some of the indicators are the same or have been merged. Effort may be taken to assess availability of data on these indicators and plans for addressing these gaps may be undertaken.

Availability of Data for Monitoring XI Plan Targets

1. This study, prepared under the Planning Commission- UNDP project 'Human Development: Towards Bridging Inequalities', presents the status of availability of reliable, timely and valid data on monitorable targets at the National and State levels, and identifies data gaps that hinder proper monitoring of Plan targets.
2. To begin with, monitorable targets in the National Plan, particularly those related to the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) and human development (HD) indicators at National, State and District levels were identified. Apart from macro-economic aggregates, poverty estimates and plan outlays/expenditure, these monitorable targets/indicators broadly fall under following sectors/categories:
 1. Agriculture
 2. Education
 3. Employment
 4. Empowerment of Socially Disadvantaged Groups
 5. Empowerment of Women and Development of Children
 6. Environment
 7. Health and Family Welfare (including Population)
 8. Housing, Water Supply and Sanitation
 9. Power and Energy
 10. Rural Development
 11. Social Welfare
 12. Special Area Programmes
 13. Telecommunication and Broadcasting
 14. Transport
3. The scope of the paper included a review of data availability for 27 monitorable targets under six major categories (Income & Poverty, Education, Health, Women & Children, Infrastructure and Environment) at National level as given in the XI Plan document. Besides, 13 out of the 27 monitorable National targets have been further disaggregated into appropriate targets for States, which are also covered under the present exercise.
4. This paper is organised as follows –
 - A. Section I provides a brief overview of the statistical system in India
 - B. Section II presents the status on availability of data on monitorable targets at the National and State levels. It elaborates on the data sources, frequency of updation and levels of disaggregation
 - C. Section III presents a matrix indicating the availability of statistics for each of the monitorable targets/indicators identified for XI Plan, highlighting the:

- a. Data Source
- b. Methodology
- c. Level of Disaggregation (geographical, gender, social)
- d. Frequency of updation
- e. Reliability and validity
- f. Comparability across States
- g. Latest year for which data is available

The first table (Table 1) shows the status of data availability for the indicators pertaining to each of the National level monitorable targets. The second table (Table 2) provides the available data for each of the National level targets/indicators during the XI Plan period. The third table (Table 3) shows the status of data availability for the indicators pertaining to each of the monitorable targets at State level¹.

5. Available information on targets/indicators as per the matrix detailed above has been collected and discussed with the concerned Officers of Plan Coordination, Perspective Planning and other divisions of the Planning Commission to elicit the National/State level details. After incorporating the information received from various divisions of the Planning Commission, MOSPI and other Ministries/Departments were approached for the remaining information.
6. The report also contains two notes – Note 1 is on the Indian Statistical Strengthening Project and Note 2 is a note on Basic Statistics for Local Level Development; and two annexes – Annex 1 on XI Plan targets & XII Plan targets at the National Level: A Comparative Analysis Based On Indicators and Annex 2 containing the Summary Record of the Consultation on Draft Base Paper on Statistical Data for Measuring Monitorable Targets, held on 20th November 2012 at the Planning Commission, New Delhi.

I. Statistical System in India

7. The Indian Statistical System functions within the overall administrative framework of the country.

SEVENTH SCHEDULE (ARTICLE 246)

List I - Union List

Entry 69 - Census

Entry 94 - Inquiries, Surveys and Statistics for the purpose of any of the Matters in this list

List II - State List

Not specifically mentioned

List III - Concurrent List

Entry 30 - Vital Statistics including registration of births and deaths

Entry 45 - Inquiries and statistics for the purpose of any of the matters specified in List II or List III

¹ Information on district level targets/indicators may be available in official records to some extent but these are not necessarily published by various State Governments for most of the targets/indicators under various Plan schemes until specifically asked for by Planning Commission or any Central/ State Ministries/ Departments. Moreover, district level information compiled, if any, is generally available with various State Governments and not at the Central Government level. Therefore, the scope of this study is limited to National and State level.

The federal administrative structure of the country is in-built in the Constitution of the India, wherein the division of administrative functions between the Government of India and the State Governments is based on the subject classifications of governance under the Union, State and Concurrent Lists. The subject of statistics is placed under the Seventh Schedule of the Constitution (refer to the box).

8. As such, both Union and State governments are responsible for statistical activities. Both in the Centre as well as in the States, the responsibilities are further divided amongst the various ministries and departments. In the Union Government, this distribution in line departments/ Ministries is according to the Allocation of Business Rules, 1961 that are amended from time to time. Broadly, statistical information flows from the States to the Centre, except in cases where data is directly collected through the National level Census/sample surveys.
9. Thus, in the decentralized official statistical system in India, at the central level, collection of statistics for different subject-specific areas like agriculture, industry, finance, health, labour etc., vests with the corresponding administrative Ministries and regulatory bodies of the Government of India. Statistical information is generated mostly as a by-product of administration and regulation or for monitoring the progress of specific programmes. However, large-scale statistical operations like the Population Census, Annual Survey of Industries, Economic Census, etc., are centralised to a specific Union Ministry mandated for the task, catering as they do to the needs of other Union level ministries and departments, as well as those of State Governments. The State level statistical system broadly follows the Central pattern, being generally decentralised laterally over the Departments of the State Government.
10. Responsibility for the co-ordination of statistical activities rests with the National Statistical Organisation (NSO) under the Ministry of Statistics and Programme Implementation (MOS&PI) at the Union level and with the various State Directorates of Economics and Statistics (DES) at the State level. While State DESs are responsible for the coordination of statistical activities in the State only, the Central Statistics Office (CSO) under the NSO, apart from coordinating statistical activities among statistical agencies in the Government of India and the various State DESs, is also the nodal agency for the planned development of the statistical system in the country. In addition, it is also responsible for statistical standard setting and training.
11. Besides the CSO, the NSO has another office- the National Sample Survey Office (NSSO) - which is responsible for large scale statistical surveys covering the entire country and for bridging data gaps.
12. The Ministry of Statistics and Programme Implementation, taken as a whole, is the nodal agency for planning and facilitating the integrated development of the statistical system in the country, and for laying down norms and standards in the field of official statistics, evolving concepts, definitions, classification and methodologies of data collection, processing and release of results.

II. Monitorable Targets in the XI Five Year Plan

A. National level

13. The twenty-seven targets at the National level fall in six major categories i.e. (i) Income and Poverty; (ii) Education; (iii) Health; (iv) Women and Children; (v) Infrastructure; and (vi) Environment. A detailed status on the availability of data for each of the targets belonging to each category is described below:

13.1 Income and Poverty

13.1.1 Average GDP growth rate of 9% per year in the Eleventh Plan period

- 13.1.1.1 Gross Domestic Product (GDP) is compiled by the CSO, MOSPI on a Quarterly/ Annual basis using the Production Approach. However, the discrepancy with the Expenditure Approach is also presented explicitly. As per the Production Approach, GDP is a concept of value added. It is the sum of gross value added (GVA) of all resident producer units (institutional sectors, or industries) plus that part (possibly the total) of taxes, less subsidies, on products which is not included in the valuation of output. GVA is the difference between output and intermediate consumption. If it is measured using prices that prevailed in a particular year called the 'base year', it is known as GDP at constant prices or real GDP.
- 13.1.1.2 GDP covers all production activities recognized by the SNA (System of National Accounts) called the production boundary. The production boundary covers production of almost all goods and services classified in the National Industrial Classification (NIC) which has been prepared in conformity with the International Standard Industrial Classification (ISIC). Production of agriculture, forestry and fishing which are used by producers for their own consumption is also included within the production boundary. Similarly, account is also taken of the rentals of buildings which are owned and occupied by the owners themselves. Own account construction activities are also similarly included. However, service production in households by household members for their own consumption is excluded.
- 13.1.1.3 The estimates of GDP are provided under major economic activity groups, namely, Agriculture and Livestock; Forestry; Fishing; Mining and Quarrying; Manufacturing; Electricity, Gas and Water Supply; Construction; Trade, Hotels and Restaurants; Transport; Communication; Banking and Insurance; Real Estate, Ownership, Legal and Business Services; and Other Services. As the estimates are prepared by major economic activities, State-wise disaggregation is not available. Even State level GSDP estimates prepared by various State Governments are not strictly comparable. However, the Central Statistics Office undertakes a separate exercise for working out comparable SDPs for the use of the Union Ministry of Finance and Planning Commission. These sets of figures are confidential in nature and not for public utility.

13.1.1.4 State level Gross State Domestic Product (GSDP) as calculated by States themselves does not equal the National level GDP upon aggregation as the calculation of sectors in States may vary from the National calculation. The converse is true as well, as National level GDP cannot be disaggregated to the State level directly. Also, compilation of GDP is not possible by gender and social group.

13.1.2 Agricultural GDP growth rate at 4% per year on the average

13.1.2.1 The contribution of the Agricultural sector to the GDP is estimated in terms of GVA using the production approach. The estimation of GVA involves valuation of the products and by-products and ancillary activities at the prices received by the producers and deducting therefrom the value of inputs of raw materials and services consumed in the process of production at purchasers' prices. In respect of operation of irrigation systems by government sources, the income approach is used. The gross factor income generated as a result of providing irrigation services is estimated. The operation of the irrigation system by agriculturists is not taken into account separately as its output gets reflected in the value of output of crops and the expenditure on its operation in the overall input costs.

13.1.2.2 Disaggregation by State, gender and social group is not available. Disaggregation is available for major agricultural crop groups, namely, Cereals, Pulses, Oil Seeds, Sugar, Fibres, Indigo Dyes and Tanning Material, Drugs and Narcotics, Condiments and Spices, Fruits and Vegetables, Other Miscellaneous Crops and By-products. Even State level GSDP estimates for Agriculture prepared by various State Governments are not strictly comparable due to use of agricultural data from different sources. However, an exercise undertaken by the CSO for working out comparable SDPs for the use of the Union Ministry of Finance and the Planning Commission provides comparable figures. This set of figures is confidential in nature and not for public utility.

13.1.3 Generation of 58 million new work opportunities

13.1.3.1 Under the planning process in India, an independent employment strategy is yet to be defined. The focus on economic growth has been viewed as essential for improving the employment situation. Initially, labour force expansion was not seen as a problem to contend with. In the Five Year Plans, the generation of employment has been viewed as part of the process of development and not as a goal in conflict with, or to be pursued independently of economic development.

13.1.3.2 The accepted method of measuring employment is the Usual Status of persons, with a reference period of 365 days prior to the date of recording employment/unemployment status. Reliable estimates of employment/unemployment are generated through National Sample Surveys conducted once in five years by National Sample Survey Organisation (NSSO).

13.1.3.3 A special group in the Planning Commission was constituted under the Chairmanship of Dr. S.P.Gupta, Member, Planning Commission to suggest strategies and programmes in the Tenth Plan for creating gainful employment opportunities for one crore people per year during each year of the Tenth Plan. The special group has also suggested restructuring in the following sectors in favour of labour intensive activity for generating additional gainful job opportunities for the Tenth Plan.

- a. Agriculture & allied sectors
- b. Greening the country through Agro Forestry
- c. Energy Plantation for Biomass power Generation
- d. Rural Sectors and Small and medium enterprises(SMEs)
- e. Education and Literacy
- f. Employment through ICT Development
- g. Health, Family and Child Welfare

13.1.3.4 According to the Special Group report, out of the proposed 5 crore job opportunities to be generated over the Tenth Plan Period, nearly 2 crore should come from specific employment generation programme and 3 crore from growth buoyancy. The estimated composition of job opportunities by the Task Force is as given below:

Sectors/Programmes	Total Additional job opportunities created over the 10th Plan (in Rs. lakhs)		Total (in Rs. lakhs)
	Growth based	Programme based	
Agriculture Including National Watershed Development Project for Rainfed Areas (NSDRPA), Farm Management programme, Agro Clinics, Greening India Programme, Watershed and Wasteland Development, Medicinal Plant, Bamboo Development and Energy Plantation like Ethanol etc.	4.1	90.6	94.7
Mining & Minerals	-2.0		-2.1
Manufacturing (Excl. Prime Minister's RozgarYojana (PMRY) & Rural Employment Generation Programme (REGP)	14.2 (large manufacturer) 60.0 (SSI)		14.2 60.0
Electricity, Gas & Water	-2.1		-2.1
Construction	63.0		63.0
Trade, Hotels & Restaurants	112.3		112.3
Transport, Storage & Communications	55.1		55.1
Financial Sector	19.3		19.3
Community Sector	-27.1	32.0	4.9
Special Programmes			
Prime Minister's RozgarYojana (PMRY) (SSI) & REGP (KVIC)		22.0 20.2	22.0 20.0
SampoornaGraminRozgarYojana (SGRY)		12.9	12.9
PradhanMantri Gram SadakYojana (PMGSY)		7.7	7.7
SwarnaJayanti Gram SwarozgarYojana (SGSY)		8.0	8.0
Total	296.8	193.2	490.0

13.1.3.5 While disaggregation by major sectors is available, there is no disaggregation of job opportunities by State, gender and social group.

13.1.3.6 The creation of job opportunities can be monitored on the basis of achievements of specific employment generating programmes and estimates brought out by NSSO through quinquennial (every five years) Employment and Unemployment Surveys. Results of the recent survey conducted during 2009-10 have been considered unsuitable for the study of unemployment and poverty estimation as this was a period of recession. The survey has been conducted again during 2011-12, which is the terminal year of the XIth Plan. A similar exercise as above needs to be attempted as soon as the results of this repeat survey become available.

13.1.4 Reduction of unemployment among the educated to less than 5%

13.1.4.1 Apart from decennial Census, there are two main sources of unemployment data. The first source is the office of the Directorate General of Employment & Training (DGET) which collects live register data from Employment Exchanges on an annual basis. Another source is the National Sample Survey Organisation (NSSO) which conducts the Employment and Unemployment Survey (large sample) on a quinquennial basis. State-wise comparisons for NSSO data under different concepts of reference period can be done.

13.1.4.2 Live Register data although available by Age, Gender, and SCs/STs, has its own limitations as all the jobseekers registered with employment exchanges are not unemployed. Moreover, all the unemployed are not registered with employment exchanges.

13.1.4.3 NSSO data is available once in 5 years with three different concepts with varied reference periods, namely, Usual Principal status, Weekly status and Current daily status (CDS). NSSO surveys have been conducted during 1999-2000, 2004-05 and 2009-10 and they are not synchronous with Five Year Plans. As already mentioned in paragraph 16.1.3.5 above, the results of Employment & Unemployment and Consumer Expenditure Survey conducted in 2009-10 have been found unsuitable for estimation of unemployment and the survey has been repeated in 2011-12. Changes in the unemployment rate of the educated can only be estimated after the results of this survey become available.

13.1.5 20% rise in the real wage rate of unskilled workers

13.1.5.1 The Labour Bureau collects wage data through Occupation Wage Surveys through rounds with a 3-10 years period. As different industry groups such as Manufacturing, Mining, Plantation & Service sectors etc. are covered in different years of a round, it is difficult to make any meaningful comparison and to provide an overall wage figure for a particular year.

13.1.5.2 NSSO provides reliable official State-wise wage data through the quinquennial Employment and Unemployment Survey which is available with a gap of 5 years.

As already mentioned, NSSO Employment and Unemployment Surveys have been conducted during 1999-2000, 2004-05 and 2009-10 which are not synchronous with Five Year Plans. Also, results of the recent survey conducted during 2009-10 are not considered suitable as they pertain to a period of recession. The survey has been conducted again during 2011-12. Results of this survey are awaited.

13.1.6 Reduction in the head-count ratio of consumption poverty by 10 percent points

- 13.1.6.1 The methodology adopted to define the poverty line and estimate poverty ratios has been reviewed from time to time. The Task Force Methodology (1979) defined the poverty line in terms of per capita monthly consumption expenditure based on a per capita calorie intake of 2400 calories in rural areas and 2100 calories in urban areas. This poverty line was uniformly applied across all the States and using the data obtained from the NSSO survey on consumer expenditure of the States, the State-wise estimates of poverty were made.
- 13.1.6.2 Later, an Expert Group set up for the purpose looked in the matter and adopted the poverty line defined by the Task Force, at the National level. However, it recommended the disaggregation of the National poverty line into State-wise poverty lines in order to reflect the State level price differential. State-specific cost of living indices were used for updating the poverty line separately in rural and urban areas.
- 13.1.6.3 The Tendulkar Committee submitted its Report in 2009, recommending use of NSSO data collected under Household Consumer Expenditure Survey on Mixed Recall Period (MRP) basis for estimating poverty. Under this method, consumption expenditure data is collected on a 365 days recall period for five non-food items, namely, clothing, footwear, education, institutional medical expenses and durable goods, and data collected on a 30 days recall period for other items is taken into account. Poverty lines have moved away from the calorie intake norm. State specific rural and urban poverty lines have been estimated for reflecting the inter-State price differentials for rural and urban areas separately, by using the implicit price indices obtained from NSSO data itself. The Planning Commission has accepted the Tendulkar Committee's recommended State-wise poverty lines and poverty ratios for the year 2004-05. The State-wise poverty lines and poverty ratios for 2009-10 have also been computed following the extant Tendulkar Methodology ².

² The latest methodology available in 2013 was not available at the time this paper was prepared. Updated information based on the latest methodology will be presented in the forthcoming paper on data availability for the national and state level monitorable targets under the XII Five Year Plan.

13.2 Education

13.2.1 Reduction in the dropout rates of children at the elementary level from 52.2% in 2003–04 to 20% by 2011–12

13.2.1.1 The Department of School Education and Literacy under the Ministry of Human Resource Development collects information by sex and different school levels on enrollment, dropouts etc. from the State Department of Education. Information is collected on an annual basis.

13.2.2 Developing minimum standards of educational attainment in elementary schools to ensure quality education

13.2.2.1 The Net Enrollment Ratio (NER) in primary education is considered a major indicator of progress towards universalisation of primary education. The estimate of this indicator is not readily available in the existing official statistical systems at National and State levels. However, the District Information System on Education (DISE) provides estimates of NER in primary education on an annual basis. DISE is the information system on education developed by National University of Educational Planning and Administration (NUEPA). But the official statistical system in general and Union Human Resource Development Ministry in particular, do not own this data on statistical considerations. The data is not comparable with data provided by the Ministry of Human Resource Development which provides data on Gross Enrollment Ratio (GER).

13.2.3 Increasing the literacy rate for persons of age 7 years or more to 85% by 2011-12

13.2.3.1 Information on literacy is collected by the Registrar General of India through the decennial Census. State-wise literacy rates by gender, SCs/STs etc. are made available after, a ten year period. The NSSO also collects information on educational attainment through various socio-economic surveys, but this information is seldom used to work out official estimates of literacy. Census data is comparable between States to ascertain their comparative literacy status.

13.2.4 Reducing the gender gap in literacy to 10 percentage points by 2011–12

13.2.4.1 The Department of School Education and Literacy and Department of Higher Education under the Union Ministry of Human Resources Development collect information on the enrollment of males and females in elementary, secondary and higher education from the State Departments of Education on an annual basis.

13.2.5 Increasing the percentage of each cohort going to higher education from the present 10% to 15% by 2011–12

- 13.2.5.1 The Department of Higher Education under the Union Ministry of Human Resources Development collects State-wise information on enrollment to Under Graduation, Post-Graduation, M. Phil/Ph.D., Post Graduate diploma etc by level/course from the University Grants Commission (UGC), All India Council for Technical Education (AICTE), Medical Council of India, Indian Nursing Council and State Departments of Education. Information is collected on annual basis.

13.3 Health

13.3.1 Infant mortality rate (IMR) to be reduced to 28 and maternal mortality ratio (MMR) to 1 per 1000 live births by the end of the Eleventh Plan

- 13.3.1.1 Information on live births, infant and child deaths, and deaths of women due to pregnancy related causes are collected on an annual basis by the Registrar General of India through the Sample Registration System taking a fairly large sample which is sufficient enough to estimate Infant Mortality Rate and Maternal Mortality Ratio at the State level. Apart from the decennial Census, this is the only authentic source which provides State level IMR & MMR estimates. As maternal deaths are relatively much lesser than infant deaths, the sample is not sufficient to provide annual estimates of MMR, and thus MMR is given as a 3 calendar years average figure for bigger States only, to avoid sample fluctuations. However, IMR is estimated for every calendar year for all States. IMR is also estimated by gender and Rural/Urban areas for bigger States.

- 13.3.1.2 No disaggregation is available by social groups for MMR.

13.3.2 Total Fertility Rate to be reduced to 2.1 by the end of the Eleventh Plan

- 13.3.2.1 As mentioned above, information on women in child bearing age and live births is collected on an annual basis by the Registrar General of India through the Sample Registration System. Besides the decennial Census, this is the only authentic source that provides State level estimates of Total Fertility Rates. There is no disaggregation available by social group.

13.3.3 Clean drinking water to be available for all by 2009, ensuring that there are no slip-backs by end of the Eleventh Plan

- 13.3.3.1 The NSSO conducts a Survey of Housing Conditions and Amenities in India which provides State-wise information on households having access to improved water sources. This survey is usually repeated every fifth year. Besides, this information is also collected under the National Family & Health Survey (NFHS) and District Level Household Survey (DLHS) as and when undertaken. However, results obtained from different surveys are not comparable due to differences in methodologies, sample size, field investigation etc. There is no disaggregation by gender and social group.

13.3.4 Malnutrition among children of age group 0–3 to be reduced to half of its present level by the end of the Eleventh Plan

13.3.4.1 Under the NFHS, information on underweight children in the age group of 0-3 years is also collected. This survey provides State-wise estimates of the percentage of underweight children, but these surveys are not conducted at regular intervals of time. The latest available NFHS survey results from the year 2005-06 on this indicator are disaggregated by gender, caste, SCs/STs and various other parameters.

13.3.5 Anaemia among women and girls to be reduced to half its present level by the end of the Eleventh Plan

13.3.5.1 Information on achievements vis-a-vis targets of prophylaxis against nutritional anaemia among women & girls is collected annually by the Union Ministry of Health and Family Welfare from the concerned State Department of Health. State-wise percentages of targets achieved are provided annually on a regular basis. Since many private health institutions have emerged recently, such data has to be collected from these institutions also. The Statistics Act 2008 empowers the Central and State Government Departments to collect data from these institutions. In case the institutions do not provide the information despite repeated requests, monetary penalties can be imposed. In cases of total non-cooperation there is a provision of 6 months imprisonment.

13.4 Women and Children

13.4.1 Sex ratio for age group 0-6 to be raised to 935 by 2011-12 and to 950 by 2016-17

13.4.1.1 Population by gender is collected and compiled under the decennial Census and State-wise sex ratios are provided as well. Though information on the number of males and females is collected through numerous survey agencies including NSSO, NFHS, DLHS etc., the Census is regarded as the most authentic source for the sex ratio of the population.

13.4.2 Ensuring that at least 33% of the direct and indirect beneficiaries of all Government schemes are women and girl children

13.4.2.1 There are numerous plan schemes run by various Ministries/Departments of the Government of India which directly and indirectly benefit women and girl children. However, the Ministry of Women and Child Development is the nodal Ministry working for the advancement of women and children. The concept of Gender Budgeting is also being pursued by the Ministry of Finance along with this Ministry to provide more funds towards meeting the development needs of women

within the budgets of all Ministries/Departments. Though financial achievements are available with Ministry of Finance, data on physical achievements need to be collected from each concerned Ministry. This could be undertaken by the Ministry of Women and Child Development.

13.4.3 Ensuring that all children enjoy a safe childhood, without any compulsion to work

13.4.3.1 The Ministry of Women and Child Development and the Ministry of Labour are the main ministries for safeguarding and protecting the rights of children. The Ministry of Labour has been working towards the abolition of Child Labour. For the purpose of rehabilitation the Ministry of Women and Child Development has established protection homes under different schemes. A new scheme named the 'Integrated Child Protection Scheme' (ICPS) has been launched as part of the XI Plan. Under this scheme information is to be collected regularly from various types of protection homes under Central/State Government, NGOs etc., annually. No information has been published so far as the necessary data management system is yet to be developed.

13.5 Infrastructure

13.5.1 To ensure electricity connection to all villages and BPL households by 2009 and reliable power by the end of the Plan

13.5.1.1 The Ministry of Power collects information on the number of villages electrified from the respective State Electricity Boards/Corporations under the Bharat Nirman programme on an annual basis.

13.5.2 To ensure all-weather road connection to all habitations with population 1000 and above (500 and above in hilly and tribal areas) by 2009, and all significant habitations by 2015

13.5.2.1 The Ministry of Rural Development has fixed State-wise annual targets of road works and road length (in km) for construction/upgradation under the Prime Minister's Gram Sadak Yojana (PMGSY)(now under Bharat Nirman) and collects achievements of the same annually from State Governments. As targets pertaining to a particular year may not be completed in the same year, the progress of work remains under revision for the next 2-3 year period.

13.5.3 To connect every village by telephone and provide broadband connectivity to all villages by 2012

13.5.3.1 The Department of Telecommunications under the Ministry of Communications and Information Technology regularly monitors the targets for providing Village Public Telephones (VPTs) in all the 5,93,601 villages and Broadband connections to all the 2,47,864 Village Panchayats. Information is collected annually.

13.5.4 To provide homestead sites to all by 2012 and step up the pace of house construction for rural poor to cover all the poor by 2016–17

13.5.4.1 The Ministry of Rural Development has achieved a target of construction of 60 lakh houses for the rural poor by March, 2009 under Bharat Nirman. A new target of construction of 1.2 crore houses for the rural poor during 2009-14 is currently being pursued, and progress is monitored regularly by the Ministry of Rural Development and the Prime Minister's Office. Work for providing homestead sites is also being monitored. Information is collected annually.

13.6 Environment

13.6.1 To increase forest and tree cover by 5 percentage points

13.6.1.1 The Ministry of Environment & Forests monitors the State-wise progress of increase in forest and tree cover through the Forest Survey of India by Remote Sensing Technology on a biannual basis.

13.6.2 To attain WHO standards of air quality in all major cities by 2011–12

13.6.2.1 The Central Pollution Control Board (CPCB) under the Ministry of Environment & Forests monitors air quality in 127 cities/towns in 26 States and 4 UTs through 2 observations per week undertaken by CPCB teams. Samples taken by CPCB teams are analysed by Central/Zonal CPCB Laboratories. Detailed city/town-wise reports of different pollutants present in the air are given on the CPCB website.

13.6.3 To treat all urban waste water by 2011–12 to clean river waters

13.6.3.1 The Central Pollution Control Board (CPCB) under the Ministry of Environment & Forests also monitors the water quality of about 200 rivers. Samples taken by CPCB teams on a monthly/quarterly basis are analysed by the Central/Zonal CPCB Laboratories. Detailed river-wise reports of different pollutants present in the water are given on the CPCB website.

13.6.4 To increase energy efficiency by 20% by 2016–17

13.6.4.1 The Central Statistics Office under the Ministry of Statistics and Programme Implementation collects energy data from the Ministry of Power, Ministry of Coal and Ministry of Petroleum & Natural Gas and computes per capita energy consumption and energy intensity (amount of energy consumed for producing one unit of GDP) figures at the National level. Information is collected on an annual basis.

B. State level

14. The XIth Plan has been formulated in a manner whereby 13 of the 27 monitorable National targets have been disaggregated into appropriate targets for individual States. The status of each of the State-wise target is as described below:

14.1 GSDP (Gross State Domestic Product) growth rate

14.1.1 Conceptually, the estimates of State income can be prepared by adopting two approaches, namely, income originating (same as production approach) and income accruing. In the income originating approach, the measurement corresponds to income originating to the factors of production physically located within the geographical boundaries of the State and represents gross/net value of goods and services produced within the State. On the other hand, the income accruing approach relates to the income accruing to the normal residents of a State. Since this measures the income that becomes available to the residents of a State, it provides a better measure of welfare of the residents of the State.

14.1.2 However, for compiling the State Domestic Product (SDP) estimates by the income accruing approach one needs data on flows of factor incomes to/from the boundaries of State i.e. on inter-State flows as well as flows to/from abroad. Due to lack of availability of this data, presently the estimates of SDP are compiled by the respective Directorates of Economics & Statistics (DES) in the States (State agencies responsible for the regional statistics), following the income originating approach. Thus the current concept of compiling the GSDP/NSDP is similar to that of compiling the GDP/NDP of the entire economy, i.e., measuring the volume in monetary terms, the total value of goods and services produced within the geographical boundary of the State.

14.1.3 The general methodology for compiling the estimates of State income is to first compile the estimates at a disaggregated level for each economic activity and then aggregate them for the whole region/State. The estimates for commodity producing sectors like agriculture, forestry, fishing, mining & quarrying, manufacturing, etc. are prepared using the production approach i.e. measuring the value of output and deducting therefrom the cost of material inputs used in the process of production. In the services sectors (non-public segment) like trade, transport, hotels & restaurants

etc., the estimates are prepared by multiplying the value added per worker by the number of workers, for the benchmark estimates and extrapolating these benchmark estimates with suitable indicators for the annual estimates. The information on value added per worker is obtained from the relevant Enterprise Surveys conducted for the purpose. The estimates of workforce are obtained using the results of large-scale sample surveys on employment & unemployment conducted by the NSSO and the decennial Census carried out in the country by the Office of Registrar General of India (RGI) and Census Commissioner.

- 14.1.4 In the preparation of State income estimates, certain activities cut across State boundaries, and thus their economic contribution cannot be assigned to any one State directly. Such activities are Railways, Communications, Banking & Insurance and Central Government Administration, and are known as the supra-regional sectors of the economy. The estimates for these supra-regional activities are compiled for the economy as a whole and allocated to the States on the basis of relevant indicators. In the case of railways, the indicators are based on the track length and passenger/goods carried, whereas in other supra-regional sectors it is the number of employees posted/allocated in the State. Certain activities like defence, paramilitary, border security force, high seas drilling etc. are still kept outside the purview of State income estimation. As such, SDPs are estimated for major sectors only. Therefore, a mere aggregation of the SDPs of different States would not be equal to the GDP of the country. Also, SDP cannot be disaggregated into District-level Domestic Product (DDP). Compilation of GDP is not possible by gender and social group.
- 14.1.5 District Domestic Product (DDP)
- 14.1.6 The estimates of District Income can also be prepared by adopting two approaches, namely, income originating and income accruing. As described earlier, the income accruing approach provides a better measure of the welfare of the residents of the region. For a realistic measurement of income received, the net inflow/outflow of income between districts needs to be taken into account. However, in an open economy like that of a district in this country, it is very doubtful whether such an estimate can be prepared unless a special effort is made for the collection of this data.
- 14.1.7 Presently, most States are compiling DDP estimates by following the income originating approach. For estimating the District Domestic Product, the economy is divided into various economic activities like agriculture, forestry, fishing, mining, manufacturing, construction, electricity, transport, communication, trade etc. In the commodity producing sectors like agriculture, forestry, fishing, mining and manufacturing (registered), the estimates of DDP are prepared using the production approach i.e., gross value added = value of output minus value of inputs used in the process of production. In the services sectors like trade, transport, hotel and restaurants etc., the estimates for the public sector are prepared by income accruing approach, i.e., gross domestic income = compensation of employees plus gross operating surplus.

14.1.8 For the unorganised sectors like unregistered manufacturing and the unorganized segments of the remaining sectors of the economy i.e. unorganized trade, unorganized hotels and restaurant, unorganized road transport, unrecognized educational institutions, unorganized medical and health services, etc. the estimates of GVA are compiled as a product of work force and gross value added (GVA) per worker. While the GVA per worker is derived from the follow-up surveys of Economic Censuses carried out by the NSSO, the work force is estimated from the quinquennial surveys of employment and unemployment of the NSSO and the population Censuses.

14.2 Agricultural growth rate

14.2.1 The sector comprises agriculture proper, livestock and livestock products and operation of irrigation systems. The economic activities included in agriculture proper are (i) growing of field crops, fruits, nuts, seeds and vegetables, (ii) management of tea, coffee and rubber plantations, (iii) agricultural and horticultural services on a fee or on contract basis such as harvesting, baling and thrashing, preparation of tobacco for marketing, pest control, spraying, pruning, picking and packing and (iv) ancillary activities of cultivators such as gur-making, transportation of own produce to primary markets, activities yielding rental income from farm buildings and farm machinery. Livestock and livestock products include breeding and rearing of animals and poultry besides private veterinary services, production of milk, slaughtering, preparation and dressing of meat, production of rawhides and skins, eggs, dung, raw wool, honey and silk worm cocoons etc. Operation of irrigation system comprises supply of water through various Government channels to the agricultural producers. Agriculture and livestock activities go together as it is not always feasible to segregate the various inputs like livestock feed, repairs and maintenance costs etc. into those used in agricultural and livestock production.

14.2.2 The estimates of GVA for this activity are compiled by the production method, except for the operation of the Government irrigation system, for which the income accruing method is followed. As mentioned earlier, the value of output is estimated for agriculture and livestock separately but the value-added estimates are prepared for the combined activity. The value of output of each crop is obtained as the product of area, yield & price or output & price as the case may be. Information is collected annually.

14.3 New work opportunities

14.3.1 An exercise on the lines of Dr S.P. Gupta's Special Group Report for the X Plan needs to be undertaken for each State separately for various relevant Sectors for the XI Plan period. (See paragraph 16.1.3.3)

14.4 Poverty ratio

14.4.1 The Tendulkar Committee's approach has been adopted by the Planning Commission for working out State wise poverty lines and poverty ratios. (See paragraph 16.1.6.3)

14.5 Drop-out rates in elementary schools

14.5.1 The State Departments of Education collect information on enrollment, dropouts etc. for males and females in primary and secondary schools and provide this information to the Central Department of School Education and Literacy. Information is collected on an annual basis.

14.6 Literacy rate

14.6.1 Information on literacy is collected by the Registrar General of India through the decennial Census. State-wise literacy rates are made available after ten year periods. NSSO also collects information on educational attainment through various socio-economic surveys, but this information is generally not used to work out official estimates of literacy. Census data is comparable between States to ascertain their comparative literacy status.

14.7 Gender gap in literacy rate

14.7.1 The State Departments of Education collect information on enrollment of males and females in elementary, secondary and higher education and provide this to the Central Department of School Education and Literacy, and to the Department of Higher Education under the Union Ministry of Human Resources Development, on an annual basis.

14.8 Infant Mortality Rate (IMR)

14.8.1 Estimates of State-wise Infant Mortality Rates are provided by the Registrar General of India through the Sample Registration System(SRS) on an annual basis.

14.9 Maternal Mortality Ratio (MMR)

14.9.1 The SRS also provides State-wise estimates of the Maternal Mortality Ratio. This is the only authentic source for MMR estimates. As maternal deaths are relatively much lesser and the sample is not sufficient to provide annual estimates of MMR, estimates of MMR are given as an average figure of 3 calendar years to avoid sample fluctuations.

14.10 Total Fertility Rate (TFR)

14.10.1 The Registrar General of India also collects fertility data through the Sample Registration System. Besides the decennial Census, this is the only authentic source for State level estimates of Total Fertility Rates.

14.11 Child malnutrition

14.11.1 Under the National Family and Health Survey (NFHS) information on underweight children in the age group of 0-3 years is collected. This survey provides State-wise estimates of the percentage of underweight children, but is not conducted at regular intervals of time. The latest NFHS survey results available are for 2005-06.

14.12 Anaemia among women and girls

14.12.1 Information on achievements vis-a-vis targets of prophylaxis against nutritional anaemia among women & girls is collected annually by the State Departments of Health. State-wise percentages of targets achieved are provided annually on a regular basis.

14.13 Sex-ratio

14.13.1 The decennial Census is the main source of data for State-wise sex ratios. Though information on the number of males and females is collected through numerous survey agencies including NSSO, NFHS, DLHS etc., the Census is regarded the most authentic source for the sex ratio of the population.

Table 1

MONITORING TARGETS/INDICATORS FOR ELEVENTH PLAN - NATIONAL LEVEL

S. No.	Monitoring Targets / Indicators	Source of Data	Methodology	Level of Disaggregation	Frequency of Update	Reliability and Validity	Comparability across States	Source of Data/Website	Data available for latest year
National Targets Major Category									
I. INCOME AND POVERTY									
1.	Average GDP Growth Rate of 9% per year in the XI Plan period	MOSPI - CSO	Gross value of production of goods and services.	Major Sectors. No disaggregation by State, gender and social group	Quarterly/Annually	Highly reliable as based on sound methodology & database	Not Applicable, as no disaggregation by State	mospi.gov.in, Reports and publications, statistical publication, CSO-National Accounts	2012-13
2.	Average Agricultural GDP Growth Rate at 4% per year	MOSPI - CSO	Gross value added due to agricultural production	Agricultural Crop Group-wise, No disaggregation by State, gender and social group	Quarterly/Annually	Highly reliable as based on sound methodology & database	Not Applicable, as no disaggregation by State	mospi.gov.in, Reports and publications, statistical publication, CSO-National Accounts	2012-13
3.	Generation of 58 million new work opportunities	Planning Commission - Ministry of Labour	Work opportunities created in various sectors	Major Sectors. No disaggregation by State, gender and social group	Specific exercise needed by Special Working Group	Reliable, if prepared by Special/ Working Group	State-wise breakup for all Sectors may not be available	dget.nic.in, Employment and Unemployment Scenario in India	X Plan
4.	Reduction of educated unemployment to less than 5%	Ministry of Labour - DGET	Live register data; NSSO Surveys	LR data- Age, Gender, SCS, STs; NSSO (large sample) - State Level	LR data Annual; NSSO large sample - Five yearly, small sample - Annual	LR data- not reliable due to methodological problems; NSSO data - reliable as based on scientific survey	NSSO data comparable as based on scientific survey	labour.gov.in, reports/publications, DGET publications; mospi.gov.in-reports/publications- NSSO	2009-10

S. No.	Monitoring Targets / Indicators	Source of Data	Methodology	Level of Disaggregation	Frequency of Update	Reliability and Validity	Comparability across States	Source of Data/Website	Data available for latest year
5.	Reduction of educated unemployment to less than 5%	Ministry of Labour - DGET	Live register data; NSSO Surveys	LR data- Age, Gender, SCs, STs; NSSO (large sample) - State Level	LR data Annual; NSSO large sample - Five yearly, small sample - Annual	LR data- not reliable due to methodological problems; NSSO data - reliable as based on scientific survey	NSSO data comparable as based on scientific survey	labour.gov.in, reports/publications, DGET publications; mospi.gov.in-reports/publications-NSSO	2009-10
6.	20% rise in the real wage rate of unskilled workers	Ministry of Labour -Labour Bureau, NSSO	Labour Bureau conducts Occupational wage survey, NSSO collects wage rates under Emp. /Unemp. Survey	Manu., Mining, Plantation & service sector; NSSO State-wise	Lab. Bureau - roundwise (3 to 10 years), NSSO five yearly	Reliable as based on well-defined survey methodology	NSSO data Comparable as based on scientific survey	labour.gov.in, reports/publications, DGET publications; mospi.gov.in-reports/publications-NSSO	2009-10
7.	Reduction in Headcount ratio of consumption poverty by 10 percentage points	Planning Commission	Methodology recommended by Tendulkar Committee in 2009	NSSO (large sample) - State Level, SCs & STs	NSSO large sample - Five yearly, small sample - Annual	Highly reliable as based on sound methodology & database	Comparable as based on scientific survey and sound methodology	planningcommission.nic.in, Data & Statistics, Data tables, No.39	2009-10

S. No.	Monitoring Targets / Indicators	Source of Data	Methodology	Level of Disaggregation	Frequency of Update	Reliability and Validity	Comparability across States	Source of Data/Website	Data available for latest year
National Targets Major Category									
II. EDUCATION									
8.	Reduction in dropout rates of children at the elementary level from 52.2% in 2003-04 to 20% by 2011-12	MHRD - Dept of School Edu.& Literacy	Data Collection from State Dept. of Education	Gender, SCs/STs, School/State level,	Annual	Reliable as based on well-defined data collection system	Comparable as based on well-defined data collection system	mhrd.gov.in, Statistics of School Education	2010-11
9.	Developing minimum standards of educational attainment in elementary schools (Net Enrollment Ratio)	DISE - NEUPA	Data collected by District Information System on Education	School/State Level	Annual	Reliable as based on well-defined data collection system	Not strictly comparable. HRD Ministry do not own this data on statistical consideration	dise.in- flash statistics, Elementary education in India	2010-11
10.	Increasing the Literacy rates for persons of age 7 years or more to 85% by 2011-12	RGI	Collected through decennial Census	State level, gender, SCs/STs	Once in ten years	Reliable Census data	Comparable Census figures	censusindia.gov.in - 2011 Census data	2010-11
11.	Reducing the gender gaps in literacy to 10 percentage points by 2011-12	MHRD - Dept. of Higher Edu/School Edu	Data Collection from State Dept. of Education	State/School level, SCs/STs	Annual	Reliable as based on well-defined data collection system	Comparable as based on well-defined data collection system	mhrd.gov.in, Statistics of School Education	2010-11

S. No.	Monitoring Targets / Indicators	Source of Data	Methodology	Level of Disaggregation	Frequency of Update	Reliability and Validity	Comparability across States	Source of Data/Website	Data available for latest year
National Targets Major Category									
III. HEALTH									
12.	Infant Mortality rate (IMR) to be reduced to 28 and Maternal Mortality ratio (MMR) to 1 Per 1000 live births by the end of the Eleventh Plan	RGI - SRS	Data collected by RGI on regular basis under SRS	State level, gender and Rural/Urban for bigger States, No disaggregation by social group; MMR for bigger States	Annual	Reliable as based on sound methodology	Comparable as based on well-defined data collection system	censusindia.gov.in - 2011 Census data- sample registration scheme	2010-11 2007-09
13.	Total Fertility Rate to be reduced to 2.1 by the end of the Eleventh Plan	RGI - SRS	Data collected by RGI on regular basis under SRS	State level, No disaggregation by gender and social group	Bi-annual	Reliable as based on sound methodology	Comparable as based on well-defined data collection system	censusindia.gov.in - 2011 Census data- sample registration scheme	2010-11
14.	Clean drinking water to be available for all by 2009, ensuring that there are no slip-backs by the end of the Eleventh Plan	NSSO, NFHS and DLHS	Data collected under NSSO Survey on Housing condition	State level, No disaggregation by gender and social group	Once in 5 years	Reliable as based on sound methodology	Comparable as based on well-defined data collection system	mospi.gov.in, Reports and publications, statistical publication, NSSO Survey Reports	2008-09

S. No.	Monitoring Targets / Indicators	Source of Data	Methodology	Level of Disaggregation	Frequency of Update	Reliability and Validity	Comparability across States	Source of Data/Website	Data available for latest year
15.	Malnutrition among children of age group 0-3 to be reduced to half its present level by the end of the Eleventh Plan	MoH&FW - NFHS	Data collected under NFHS	State level, gender, SCs/ STs and various parameters	1992-93, 1998-99, 2005-06	Reliable as based on scientific surveys	Comparable as based on well-defined data collection system	mohfw.nic.in, Dept. of Family Welfare, Statistics Division, rchiips.org - NFHS	2005-06
16.	Anaemia among women and girls to be reduced to half its present level by the end of the Eleventh Plan	MoH&FW	Data on targets achieved are collected from State Health Dept.	State level, No disaggregation by social group	Annual	Reliable as based on well-defined data collection system	Comparable as based on well-defined data collection system	mohfw.nic.in, Dept. of Family Welfare, Statistics Division - publications Family welfare Statistics in India - 2011	2010-11

S. No.	Monitoring Targets / Indicators	Source of Data	Methodology	Level of Disaggregation	Frequency of Update	Reliability and Validity	Comparability across States	Source of Data/Website	Data available for latest year
National Targets Major Category									
IV. WOMEN AND CHILDREN									
17.	Sex Ratio for age group 0-6 to be raised to 935 by 2011-2012 and to 950 by 2016-17	RGI	Collected through decennial Census	State level, It can be computed by social group	Once in ten years	Reliable Census data	Comparable decennial Census data	censusindia.gov.in - 2011 Census data, provisional population totals	2010-11
18.	Ensuring that at least 33% of the direct and indirect beneficiaries of all government schemes are women and girl children	Planning Commission/MWCD	Collected from various Central Min./Depts.	Plan Schemes, It is gender specific indicator	BT to be collected annually	Reliable as it will be based on well-defined data collection system	State-wise breakup of all plan schemes may not be available	planningcommission.nic.in	Not available
19.	Ensuring that all children enjoy a safe childhood, without any compulsion to work	Ministry of Power	Data collected from State electricity boards	State-wise, No disaggregation by gender or social group	Annual	Reliable as based on well-defined data collection system	Comparable as based on well-defined data collection system	wcd.nic.in, child protection-ICPS	2011-12

S. No.	Monitoring Targets / Indicators	Source of Data	Methodology	Level of Disaggregation	Frequency of Update	Reliability and Validity	Comparability across States	Source of Data/Website	Data available for latest year
National Targets Major Category									
V. INFRASTRUCTURE									
20.	To ensure electricity connection to all villages and BPL households by 2009 and reliable power by the end of the plan (Number of villages electrified)	Ministry of Power	Data collected from State electricity boards	State-wise, No disaggregation by gender or social group	Annual	Reliable as based on well-defined data collection system	Comparable as based on well-defined data collection system	powermin.nic.in, rural electrification, Bharat Nirman	2011-12
21.	To ensure all-weather road connection to all habitations with population 1000 and above (500 and above in hilly and tribal areas) by 2009, and all significant habitations by 2015. (Road work completed & length constructed/upgraded)	MoRD	Data Collection from State Dept. of Rural Development	State-wise, disaggregation by gender and social group not applicable	Annual	Reliable as based on well-defined data collection system	Comparable as based on well-defined data collection system	mord.nic.in, pmgsy.nic.in	2011-12

S. No.	Monitoring Targets / Indicators	Source of Data	Methodology	Level of Disaggregation	Frequency of Update	Reliability and Validity	Comparability across States	Source of Data/Website	Data available for latest year
22.	To connect every village by telephone and provide broadband connectivity to all villages (Panchayats) by 2012	Dept. Of Telecommunications	Data collected from various telecom circles	Telecom Circle-wise, disaggregation by gender and social group not applicable	Annual	Reliable as based on well-defined data collection system	To be compared carefully as some circles are composed of more than one State	dot.gov.in - Bharat Nirman	2010-11
23.	To provide homestead sites to all by 2012 and step-up the pace of house construction for rural poor to cover all the poor by 2016-17	MoHUPA, MoRD	Data collected from concerned State Govt. Dept.	State-wise, disaggregation by gender not available	Annual	Reliable as based on well-defined data collection system	Comparable as based on well-defined data collection system	mhupa.gov.in, rural.nic.in	2011-12

S. No.	Monitoring Targets / Indicators	Source of Data	Methodology	Level of Disaggregation	Frequency of Updation	Reliability and Validity	Comparability across States	Source of Data/Website	Data available for latest year
National Targets Major Category									
VI. ENVIRONMENT									
24.	To increase forest and tree cover by 5 percentage points	MoEF	Forest Survey of India - Remote Sensing Technology	State-wise, disaggregation by gender and social group not applicable	2 to 4 years	Reliable as based on highly scientific methods	Comparable as based on scientific methods	moef.nic.in- Annual Report	2010-11
25.	To attain WHO standards of air quality in all major cities by 2011-12	MoEF -Central Pollution Control Board	Samples taken by CPCB teams analysed at CPCB Central/zonal labs	127 Cities/ towns in 26 States & 4 UTs, disaggregation by gender and social group not applicable	2 observations per week	Reliable as based on highly scientific methods	Not relevant	cpcb.nic.in, Data/ Statistics	February, 2007
26.	To treat all urban waste water by 2011-12 to clean river waters	MoEF -Central Pollution Control Board	Samples taken by CPCB teams analysed at CPCB Central/zonal labs	200 rivers, disaggregation by gender and social group not applicable	Monthly/ quarterly	Reliable as based on highly scientific methods	Not relevant	cpcb.nic.in, Data/ Statistics	Basinwise Water Quality Data 2011
27.	To increase energy efficiency by 20% by 201617.	MOSPI - CSO- Ministry of Power/ Coal /Petroleum	Data collected from Ministry of Power/ Coal / Petroleum Computed by CSO	No Statewise- disaggregation by gender and social group not applicable	Annual	Reliable as based on sound methodology & database	Not possible	mospi.gov.in, Central Statistics Office, Other Statistics- Energy Statistics	2010-11

ACHIEVEMENTS OF MONITORING TARGETS/INDICATORS FOR ELEVENTH PLAN - NATIONAL LEVEL

S. No.	National Targets Major Category	Monitoring Targets / Indicators	Source of Data	Achievements					Terminal year targets	
				Initial year	2007-08	2008-09	2009-10	2010-11		2011-12
I. INCOME AND POVERTY										
1.		Average GDP Growth Rate of 9% per year in the XI Plan period	MOSPI - CSO	2004-05 - 7.60	9.30	6.70	8.40	8.39	6.50	2007-12 - 9%
2.		Average Agricultural GDP Growth Rate at 4% per year	MOSPI - CSO	2004-05 - 1.60	5.80	0.10	1.00	7.00	2.80	2007-12 - 4%
3.		Generation of 58 million new work opportunities	Planning Commission - Ministry of Labour	Tenth Plan 49 Million						XI Plan - 58 Million

S. No.	National Targets Major Category	Monitoring Targets / Indicators	Source of Data	Achievements							Terminal year targets
				Initial year	2007-08	2008-09	2009-10	2010-11	2011-12		
4.		Reduction of educated unemployment to less than 5% (Educated 10th standard and above on live register in millions- 2007 is given under 2007-08 & likewise)	Ministry of Labour - DGET, NSSO	2000 - 29.2	30.65	29.25	29.17				
5.		20% rise in the real wage rate of un-skilled workers	Ministry of Labour -NSSO				Rs. 168				
6.		Reduction in Head-count ratio of consumption poverty by 10 percentage points	Planning Commission	1990 - 47.5 2004-05 - 37.2	34.24 interpolated		29.80				2015 - 23.75

S. No.	National Targets Major Category	Monitoring Targets / Indicators	Source of Data	Achievements						Terminal year targets
				Initial year	2007-08	2008-09	2009-10	2010-11	2011-12	
II. EDUCATION										
7.		Reduction in dropout rates of children at the elementary level from 52.2% in 2003-04 to 20% by 2011-12	MHRD - Dept of School Edu. & Literacy	2003-04 -52.20% 2006-07 - 45.90%	42.68	42.25	42.39	40.60		2011-12 - 20%
8.		Developing minimum standards of educational attainment in primary (I to V) and middle (VI to VIII) schools (Net Enrollment Ratio)	DISE -MHRD	2006-07 92.75% 48.45%	95.92 52.55	98.59 56.22	98.28 58.29	99.89 61.22		2015 - 100% 100%
9.		Increasing the Literacy rates for persons of age 7 years or more to 85% by 2011-12	RGI	2001 - 64.84				74.04		2011-12 - 85%

S. No.	National Targets Major Category	Monitoring Targets / Indicators	Source of Data	Achievements							Terminal year targets
				Initial year	2007-08	2008-09	2009-10	2010-11	2011-12		
10.		Reducing the gender gaps in literacy to 10 percentage points by 2011-12 (elementary, secondary and Higher education- Gender Parity Index)	MHRD - Dept of Higher. Edu/ School Edu	2006-07 0.81 0.83	0.96 0.85 0.84	0.99 0.85 0.85	0.97 0.88 0.87	0.99 0.88 0.86		2011-12- 100% 89.1% 91.3%	
11.		Increasing the percentage of each cohort going to higher education from the present 10% to 15% by 2011-12 (M.Phil/Ph.D, Post Graduate, Under Graduate)	MHRD - Dept of Higher. Edu				92,211 18,33,507 1,38,72,870				

S. No.	National Targets Major Category	Monitoring Targets / Indicators	Source of Data	Achievements					Terminal year targets
				Initial year	2007-08	2008-09	2009-10	2010-11	
III. HEALTH									
12.		Infant Mortality rate (IMR) to be reduced to 28 and Maternal Mortality ratio (MMR) to 1 Per 1000 live births by the end of the eleventh plan. (2009 figure given under 2009-10 and likewise)	RGİ - SRS	1990 - 80, 2003 - 60, 2006 - 57	55.00	53.00	50.00	47.00	2011-12 - 28 2015 - 27
		IMR-							
		MMR-	RGİ - SRS	1990 - 4.37, 2004-06 - 2.54		2007-09 - 2.12			01-12-2011
13.		Total Fertility Rate to be reduced to 2.1 by the end of the Eleventh Plan. (2008 figure given under 2008-09 and likewise)	RGİ - SRS			2.60		2.50	

S. No.	National Targets Major Category	Monitoring Targets / Indicators	Source of Data	Achievements						Terminal year targets	
				Initial year	2007-08	2008-09	2009-10	2010-11	2011-12		
14.		Clean drinking water to be available for all by 2009, ensuring that there are no slip-backs by the end of the Eleventh Plan.	NSSO, NFHS and DLHS	1990 - 66.4%	84.40%	91.40%					2009 - 100%
15.		Malnutrition among children of age group 0-3 to be reduced to half its present level by the end of the Eleventh Plan (percentage of underweight children)	MoH&FW - NFHS	1990 - 52.01% 2005-06 - 40.4%							2015 - 26%
16.		Anaemia among women and girls to be reduced to half its present level by the end of the Eleventh Plan(% annual target achieved)	MoH&FW	2006-07 - 64.40%	50.60	77.50	87.80	82.90			

S. No.	National Targets Major Category	Monitoring Targets / Indicators	Source of Data	Achievements					Terminal year targets
				Initial year	2007-08	2008-09	2009-10	2010-11	
IV. WOMEN AND CHILDREN									
17.		Sex Ratio for age group 0-6 to be raised to 935 by 2011-2012 and to 950 by 2016-17	RGI	2001 - 927			914		2011-12 - 935 2016-17 - 950
18.		Ensuring that at least 33% of the direct and indirect beneficiaries of all government schemes are women and girl children	Planning Commission						
19.		Ensuring that all children enjoy a safe childhood, without any compulsion to work	MWCD/ Ministry of Labour						

S. No.	National Targets Major Category	Monitoring Targets / Indicators	Source of Data	Achievements					Terminal year targets
				Initial year	2007-08	2008-09	2009-10	2010-11	
V. INFRASTRUCTURE									
20.		To ensure electricity connection to all villages and BPL households by 2009 and reliable power by the end of the plan (Number of villages electrified)	Ministry of Power		497236	500920	537947	560000 BPL HH 19425283	All Villages All BPL household by 2009
21.		To ensure all-weather road connection to all habitations with population 1000 and above (500 and above in hilly and tribal areas) by 2009, and all significant habitations by 2015.(Road constructed/ upgraded in KM)	MoRD	58577	54922	55114	5827	452	22

S. No.	National Targets Major Category	Monitoring Targets / Indicators	Source of Data	Achievements						Terminal year targets
				Initial year	2007-08	2008-09	2009-10	2010-11	2011-12	
22.		To connect every village (5,93,601) by telephone (VPTs) and provide broadband connectivity to all villages (Panchayats - 2,47,864) by 2012 Broad-band	Dept. Tele-comm.					Cum. March, 2011 5,79,888		5,93,601
23.		To provide homestead sites to all by 2012 and step-up the pace of house construction for rural poor to cover all the poor by 2016-17	MoRD	Upto 2009 60 lakhs			3224971	2479337	603828	2009-14 1.2 crore houses
		Homestead sites						44259	19627	
24.		To increase forest and tree cover by 5 percentage points.	MoEF	2007 - 690899 Sq. Km.				692027 Sq. Km..		725444 Sq. Km.

S. No.	National Targets Major Category	Monitoring Targets / Indicators	Source of Data	Achievements							Terminal year targets	
				Initial year	2007-08	2008-09	2009-10	2010-11	2011-12			
25.		To attain WHO standards of air quality in all major cities by 2011-12	CPCB	Details available at CPCB website								
26.		To treat all urban waste water by 2011-12 to clean river waters	CPCB	Details available at CPCB website								
27.		To increase energy efficiency by 20% by 2016-17 (Energy Intensity)	MOSPI – CSO, Ministry of Power	2006-07 0.1355	0.1325	0.1166	0.1224	0.1167 (Provisional)				

MONITORING TARGETS/INDICATORS FOR ELEVENTH PLAN - STATE LEVEL

S. No.	National Targets Major Category	Monitoring Targets / Indicators for the State	Source of Data	Methodology	Level of Disaggregation	Frequency of Update	Reliability and Validity	Comparability across States/Districts	Source of Data/Website	Data available for latest year
I. INCOME AND POVERTY										
1.		Average GSDP(Gross State Domestic Product) Growth Rate per year in the XI Plan period	State DES - State Income Units	Gross value of production of goods and services	Major Sectors. No District wise disaggregation	Quarterly/ Annually	Highly reliable as based on sound methodology & database	Not comparable, although methodology is same but databases differs from State to State	mospi.gov. in, Reports and publications, statistical publication, CSO-National Accounts	2011-12
2.		Average Agricultural GSDP (Gross State Domestic Product) Growth Rate per year	State DES - State Income Units	Gross value added due to agricultural production	Agricultural Crop Group-wise	Quarterly/ Annually	Highly reliable as based on sound methodology & database	Not comparable, although methodology is same but databases may differ from State to State	mospi.gov. in, Reports and publications, statistical publication, CSO-National Accounts	2011-12
3.		Generation of new work opportunities	Planning Commission -Ministry of Labour	Work opportunities created in various sectors	Major Sectors. No disaggregation by District, gender and social group	Specific exercise needed by Special/ Working Group	Reliable, if prepared by Special/ Working Group	District-wise breakup for all Sectors may not be available	dget. nic.in, Employment and Unemployment Scenario in India at National level	Not available

S. No.	National Targets Major Category	Monitoring Targets / Indicators for the State	Source of Data	Methodology	Level of Disaggregation	Frequency of Update	Reliability and Validity	Comparability across States/Districts	Source of Data/Website	Data available for latest year
4.		Reduction in Head-count ratio of consumption poverty by percentage points	Planning Commission	Methodology recommended by Tendulkar Committee in 2009	NSSO (large sample) - State Level, SCs & STs, No disaggregation by District and gender	NSSO large sample - Five yearly, small sample - Annual	Highly reliable as based on sound methodology & database	Comparable at State level as based on scientific survey and sound methodology	planning-commission.nic. Data & Statistics, Data tables, No.39	2009-10
II. EDUCATION										
5.		Reduction in drop-out rates of children in the elementary schools	State Dept. of Education	Data Collection by State Dept. of Education	Gender, SCs/ STs, School/ State level,	Annual	Reliable as based on well-defined data collection system	Comparable as based on well-defined data collection system	mhrd. gov.in, Statistics, Statistics for School Education	2010-11
6.		Increasing the Literacy rates for persons of age 7 years or more	RGI	Collected through decennial Census	State/District level, gender, SCs/STs	Once in ten year	Reliable Census data	Comparable Census figures	censusindia.gov.in - 2011 Census data	2010-11
7.		Reducing the gender gaps in literacy rate	State Dept. of Education	Data Collection by State Dept. of Education	State/District, School level, SCs/STs	Annual	Reliable as based on well-defined data collection system	Comparable as based on well-defined data collection system	mhrd. gov.in, Statistics, Statistics of School Education	2010-11

S. No.	National Targets Major Category	Monitoring Targets / Indicators for the State	Source of Data	Methodology	Level of Disaggregation	Frequency of Update	Reliability and Validity	Comparability across States/Districts	Source of Data/Website	Data available for latest year
III. HEALTH										
8.		Reduction in Infant Mortality rate (IMR)	RGI-SRS	Data collected by RGI on regular basis under SRS	State level, gender and Rural/Urban for bigger States, No disaggregation by social group	Annual	Reliable as based on sound methodology	Comparable as based on well-defined data collection system	censindia.gov. in - 2011 Census data-sample registration scheme	2010-11
9.		Reduction in Maternal Mortality ratio (MMR)	RGI-SRS	Data collected by RGI on regular basis under SRS	For bigger States, No disaggregation by social group	Three yearly averages	Reliable as based on sound methodology	Comparable as based on well-defined data collection system	censindia.gov. in - 2011 Census data-sample registration scheme	2007-09
10.		Reduction in Total Fertility Rate	RGI-SRS	Data collected by RGI on regular basis under SRS	State level, No disaggregation by gender and social group	Bi-annual	Reliable as based on sound methodology	Comparable as based on well-defined data collection system	censindia.gov. in - 2011 Census data-sample registration scheme	2009-10

S. No.	National Targets Major Category	Monitoring Targets / Indicators for the State	Source of Data	Methodology	Level of Disaggregation	Frequency of Update	Reliability and Validity	Comparability across States/Districts	Source of Data/Website	Data available for latest year
11.		Reduction in Child Malnutrition in the age group of 0-3years	MoHFW-NFHS	Data collected under NFHS	State level, gender, caste,SCs/STs and various parameters	1992-93, 1998-99, 2005-06	Reliable as based on scientific surveys	Comparable as based on well-defined data collection system	mohfw.nic.in, Dept. of Family Welfare, Statistics Division, rchiips.org - NFHS	2005-06
12.		Anaemia among women and girls to be reduced	State Health Dept.	Data on targets achieved are collected by State Health Dept.	State/ District level, No disaggregation by social group	Annual	Reliable as based on well defined data collection system	Comparable as based on well defined data collection system	mohfw.nic.in, Dept. of Family Welfare, Statistics Division - publications Family welfare Statistics in India - 2011	2010-11
IV. WOMEN AND CHILDREN										
13.		Sex Ratio for age group 0-6 to be raised	RGI	Collected through decennial Census	State/ District level, It can be computed by social group	Once in ten year	Reliable Census data	Comparable decennial Census data	censusindia.gov.in - 2011 Census data, provisional population totals	2010-11

Note 1: India Statistical Strengthening Project (ISSP)³

The India Statistical Strengthening Project (ISSP) is a comprehensive Project of the Ministry of Statistics & Programme Implementation (MOS&PI), Government of India, primarily designed to strengthen and improve the State statistical systems by way of providing adequate technical and financial support to improve their statistical capacity and infrastructure for collecting, compiling and disseminating reliable official statistics for policy planning purposes particularly at the State and Sub-State levels. ISSP aims to cover certain key areas of support to the States/UTs viz. (i) Improving Management and Coordination of Statistical Activities, (ii) Developing Statistical Skills and Capacity (Human Resource Development), (iii) Developing Statistical Infrastructure and Physical Infrastructure, including Civil Works and ICT (Information and Communication Technology) facilities, (iv) Conducting Surveys and Studies and (v) Improving Statistical Operations (data collection, processing, management and dissemination), particularly for the following identified 20 key statistical activities:

1. Estimation of State Domestic Product
2. Estimation of Capital formation and Savings
3. Estimation of District Domestic Product
4. Estimation of the contribution of local bodies
5. Compilation of data on major Fiscal variables
6. Participation in the conduct of Annual Survey of Industries
7. Compilation of Index of Industrial Production
8. Estimation of Crop area and Production
9. Compilation of Wholesale Price Index numbers
10. Compilation of Consumer Price Index numbers
11. Collection and compilation of Health, Morbidity and Mortality and Family Welfare Statistics
12. Collection and compilation of Education and Literacy statistics
13. Collection and compilation of Labour and Employment statistics
14. Collection and compilation of Housing statistics
15. Birth and Death registration and Population
16. Compilation of Electricity production and distribution statistics
17. Compilation of Environment and Forest statistics
18. Participation in the surveys of National Sample Survey Organization
19. Compilation of Transport statistics and
20. Collection and compilation of Statistics for local area planning

All the States/UTs, except for Goa and Chandigarh, are already participating in the Project. The participating States/UTs are required to prepare their respective and individual State Strategic Statistical Plans (SSSPs), outlining inter-alia the Vision, Development Plan and Implementation Strategies for the respective State/UT, keeping in view, among other things, the National Strategic Statistical Plan (NSSP) and the relevant SSSP related guidelines issued earlier by the Ministry of Statistics & Programme Implementation (MOS&PI), besides State-specific priorities and additional data/information requirements at the respective State/UT level.

³ Status of implementation is as of March 2013.

ISSP, being the first ever project of its kind to be implemented in India, is envisaged to be implemented in stages/phases to meet its objectives and targets, with the implementation of already approved SSSPs extending through the XII Plan period. For the year 2012-13, an allocation of Rs. 200 crores (BE) was earlier made for the Project, out of an overall XII Plan funds allocation estimated for the Project to the tune of Rs. 684.67 crores.

All the States/UTs, except for Goa and Chandigarh, are already participating in this Project by means of sending their Letters of Participation (LOPs) to MOS&PI. So far the SSSPs of 13 States/UT, namely, Karnataka, Rajasthan, Gujarat, Andhra Pradesh, Bihar, Tamil Nadu, Kerala, Mizoram, Sikkim, Lakshadweep, Odisha, West Bengal and Jharkhand have been approved initially at the State/UT level and subsequently by the High Level Steering Committee (HLSC) on ISSP in the Government of India and thereafter, all these 13 States/UT have also signed their respective and case-specific MoUs under the Project with MOS&PI. After receiving the entitled first installment of funds under ISSP from MOS&PI in accordance with the respective MoUs, all these States/UT have commenced the implementation of the Project.

This apart, the draft SSSP and the MoU based thereon of the Government of Nagaland is now ready for being placed before the Government of India's HLSC for its examination and approval. Also, after several rounds of discussions with the ISSP Unit over the past few months, the draft SSSPs of Assam, Arunachal Pradesh and Manipur are also now almost ready and their draft SSSPs, along with the associated MoUs are expected to be approved shortly by the respective State Governments, after which these will be placed before the Government of India's HLSC on ISSP for examination and approval.

Besides the above, five other States viz, Himachal Pradesh, Punjab, Madhya Pradesh, Maharashtra and Delhi have also since achieved significant progress in regard to the finalization of the respective SSSPs and the MoUs based thereon. In addition, Haryana, Uttarakhand and Pondicherry are also understood to have achieved significant levels of progress in terms of formulation and/are finalization of their SSSPs. However, the remaining States/UTs participating in the ISSP are learnt to be at various early/preliminary stages of progress with regard to the preparation of their SSSPs.

Though ISSP supports 20 key Statistical Activities, the States are free to include any indicator in their State Strategic Strengthening Plan (SSSP). The Planning Commission may impress upon the State Governments to include all the monitorable targets in their SSSP.

Note 2: Basic Statistics for Local Level Development (BSLLD)

The Constitutional 73rd and 74th amendments envisage a major reform of governance which gives greater responsibilities and powers to the Panchayats and Nagar Palikas and offers opportunities for local planning, effective implementation and monitoring of various social and economic development programmes. This has necessitated the availability of data and information on vital indicators at the local level. The National Statistical Commission under the Chairmanship of Dr. C. Rangarajan in 2001 had recommended developing a system of regular collection of data on a set of core variables to be compiled at local level for micro level planning.

The Central Statistics Office in the year 2002 constituted a high power Expert Committee on Basic Statistics for Local Level Development with a Member of the Planning Commission as its Chairman to (a) finalize indicators on which data is to be collected, collated and aggregated at Panchayat/block/district levels with their periodicity, (b) examine the availability of facilities for onward transmission of data from various levels, and (c) suggest improvements in the existing statistical system and infrastructure at all levels. The Committee made the following recommendations:

- (i) The Gram Panchayat should consolidate, maintain and own village level data.
- (ii) Village level information may be collected uniformly by using the Village Schedule. Data on the following can be collected:
 - a. Availability of basic facilities in the village
 - b. Assets available in the village viz. number of factories, business establishments, bridges, declared forest area, orchards, roads etc
 - c. Distance of the village from nearest facilities
 - d. Demographic status of villagers, including population, births, deaths, morbidity, migration, marriages etc
 - e. Educational status of the villagers
 - f. Land utilisation statistics
 - g. Livestock and poultry
 - h. Market outlets
 - i. Employment status of the villagers
- (iii) There will be periodic datasets which may be collected once in a year (possibly in the month of April). These include data on population (both age-group wise and social group wise), total number of households, number of households headed by women, number of households below poverty line, data on morbidity and disability, number of literate persons, data on enrolment and drop out, land utilisation in the village, number of market outlets etc.

- (iv) Some datasets will be dynamic in nature and may be collected every month of the year. These include number of live births, still births and deaths, number of deaths of women, number of pregnant women, data on migration, total number of outdoor and indoor patients and their details, total number of marriages, number of street children, sex workers, beggars, incidence of violence against women, number of small-scale enterprises and workers therein etc.
- (v) Village level registers should be developed and maintained through compilation of village level statistics to have a continuous flow of data. The village panchayat will take the basic responsibility of maintaining proper registers at their level.

Following the recommendations of the High Powered Committee, village level schedules and instruction manuals for compilation of data have been prepared. There are two schedules for compilation of Basic Statistics for Local Level Development (BSLLD). Both the Schedules-A and Schedule-B are to be filled in for each village in a Gram Panchayat.

The information in the village schedule is not to be collected by conducting a house-to-house survey. The information is to be recorded in the schedule from the records available at the village level and is to be maintained by village level functionaries, such as the Anganwadi teacher, ANM, Panchayat Secretary, school teacher, Patwari, village headman, and knowledgeable person etc. The village Directory of Census 2001 may also be utilized in certain cases.

The District Statistics Office (DSO) will coordinate with village Panchayats and village level functionaries from different departments for getting the information compiled in the village schedule. Completed schedules will be received by the DSO and scrutiny of these schedules will be undertaken. Data entry and tabulation of data at the district level will also be conducted at the DSO. The DES will ensure consolidation and tabulation of data, and publication of the report.

Quality data at the sub-State level will be available for each State in the form of organised databases, in the form of a handbook, and in soft form. This data will be utilized for planning and implementation of rural development programmes of the Central and State Governments at district/block/Panchayat/village level.

The BSLLD scheme was undertaken in the first stage on a pilot basis in 51 districts in 32 States/UTs. As the scheme was meant to cover rural areas, Delhi and Chandigarh did not participate in the scheme. The scheme has now entered its second phase and funds have been released for 24 States. It will take some time for the scheme to stabilize and obtain the desired grassroots level data.

REFERENCES

1. Abolition of Child Labour in India, Strategies for the Eleventh Plan, Ministry of Labour & Employment, New Delhi.
2. All India Survey on Higher Education, 2010-11, provisional, Department of Higher Education, Ministry of Human Resource Development, New Delhi.
3. Employment Scenario in India (Mimeographed), Planning Commission, New Delhi.
4. India in Figures- A Ready Reference 2012, Central Statistics Office, Ministry of Statistics and programme Implementation, New Delhi.
5. Maharashtra Economic Review, 2011-12, Government of Maharashtra, Mumbai.
6. Millennium Development Goals, India Country Report 2011, Central Statistics Office, Ministry of Statistics and programme Implementation, New Delhi.
7. National Accounts Statistics, 2012, Central Statistics Office, Ministry of Statistics and programme Implementation, New Delhi.
8. New series of National Accounts Statistics (Base year 2004-05), Central Statistics Office, Ministry of Statistics and programme Implementation, New Delhi.
9. Second Annual Report to the Peoples on Employment, 2011 Ministry of Labour and Employment, New Delhi.
10. Sources and Methods, 2012. National Accounts Statistics, Central Statistics Office, Ministry of Statistics and programme Implementation, New Delhi.
11. Statistics of Higher and Technical Education, 2009-10, Bureau of Planning, Monitoring & Statistics, Ministry of Human Resource Development, New Delhi.
12. Statistics of School Education, 2009-10, Bureau of Planning, Monitoring & Statistics, Ministry of Human Resource Development, New Delhi.
13. Statistics Year Book, 2012, Central Statistics Office, Ministry of Statistics and Programme Implementation, New Delhi.
14. Rajasthan Economic Review, 2011-12, Government of Rajasthan, Jaipur.

XI PLAN TARGETS & XII PLAN TARGETS AT THE NATIONAL LEVEL:

A COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS BASED ON INDICATORS

While the XI Five Year plan had 27 monitorable targets, the XII Five Year Plan has 25 monitorable targets. A comparison of the indicators for monitorable targets of both Plans shows the following similarities and differences:

UNCHANGED INDICATORS (TOTAL = 4):

S.No.	TARGET CATEGORY (according to XII Plan)	XI PLAN	XII PLAN
1.	Economic Growth	Agricultural GDP growth rate at 4 per cent per year on the average	Agriculture Growth Rate at 4 per cent per year
2.	Poverty and Employment	Reduction in the headcount ratio of consumption poverty by 10 percentage points	Head-count ratio of consumption poverty to be reduced by 10 percentage points over the preceding estimates by the end of Twelfth Five Year Plan
3.	Health	Total Fertility Rate to be reduced to 2.1 by the end of the Eleventh Plan	Reduce Total Fertility Rate to 2.1 by the end of the Twelfth Five Year Plan
4.	Health	Malnutrition among children of age group 0-3 to be reduced to half of its present level by the end of the Eleventh Plan	Reduce under-nutrition among children aged 0-3 years to half of the NFHS-3 levels by the end of the Twelfth Five Year Plan.

Note: 'Unchanged targets' contains all those indicators for which the data source remains the same, despite changes in the exact target value.

MERGED INDICATORS (TOTAL = 1):

S.No.	TARGET CATEGORY (according to XII Plan)	XI PLAN	XII PLAN
1.	Health	<p>Infant Mortality rate (IMR) to be reduced to 28 and Maternal Mortality ratio (MMR) to 1 per 1000 live births by the end of the eleventh plan.</p> <p>Sex Ratio for age group 0-6 to be raised to 935 by 2011-2012 and to 950 by 2016-17</p>	Reduce IMR to 25 and MMR to 1 per 1000 live births by the end of the Twelfth Five Year Plan and improve Child Sex ratio (0-6) years to 950 by the end of the Twelfth Five Year Plan

MODIFIED INDICATORS (TOTAL = 7):

S.No.	TARGET CATEGORY (according to XII Plan)	XI PLAN	XII PLAN
1.	Economic Growth	Average GDP growth rate of 9 per cent per year	Real GDP growth rate of 8.2 per cent
2.	Poverty and Employment	Generation of 58 million new work opportunities	Generate 50 million new work opportunities in the non-farm sector and provide skill certification to equivalent numbers during the Twelfth Five Year Plan
3.	Education	Increasing the percentage of each cohort going to higher education from the present 10% to 15% by 2011-12	Enhance access to higher education by creating two million additional seats for each age cohort aligned to the skill needs of the economy
4.	Education	Reducing the gender gap in literacy to 10 percentage points by 2011-12	Eliminate gender and social gap in school enrolment (that is, between girls and boys, and between SCs, STs, Muslim and the rest of the population) by the end of Twelfth Five Year Plan rest of the population) by the end of Twelfth Five Year Plan.

S.No.	TARGET CATEGORY (according to XII Plan)	XI PLAN	XII PLAN
5.	Infrastructure	To ensure all-weather road connection to all habitations with population 1000 and above (500 and above in hilly and tribal areas) by 2009, and all significant habitations by 2015	Connect all villages with all-weather roads by the end of the Twelfth Five Year plan
6.	Infrastructure	To connect every village by telephone and provide broadband connectivity to all villages by 2012	Increase rural tele-density to 70 per cent by the end of the Twelfth Five Year plan
7.	Environment	To increase forest and tree cover by 5 percentage points	Increase green cover (as measured by satellite imagery) by 1 million hectare every year during the Twelfth Five Year plan

DROPPED INDICATORS (TOTAL = 14):

S.No.	TARGET CATEGORY (according to XII Plan)	XI PLAN	XII PLAN
1.	Economic Growth	Reduction of unemployment among the educated to less than 5 per cent	
2.	Economic Growth	20 per cent rise in in the real wage rate of unskilled workers	
3.	Education	Reduction in the dropout rates of children at the elementary level from 52.2 per cent in 2003-04 to 20 per cent by 2011-12	
4.	Education	Developing minimum standards of educational attainment in elementary schools, to ensure quality education	

S.No.	TARGET CATEGORY (according to XII Plan)	XI PLAN	XII PLAN
5.	Education	Increasing the literacy rate for persons of age 7 years or more to 85% by 2011-12	
6.	Health	Clean drinking water to be available for all by 2009, ensuring that there are no slip-backs by the end of the eleventh Plan	
7.	Health	Anaemia among women and girls to be reduced to half its present level by the end of the Eleventh Plan	
8.	Women and Children	Ensuring that at least 33% of the direct and indirect beneficiaries of all government schemes are women and girl children	
9.	Women and Children	Ensuring that all children enjoy a safe childhood, without any compulsion to work	
10.	Infrastructure	To ensure electricity connection to all villages and BPL households by 2009 and reliable power by the end of the Plan	
11.	Infrastructure	To provide homestead sites to all by 2012 and step up the pace of house construction for rural poor to cover all the poor by 2016-17	
12.	Environment	To attain WHO standards of air quality in all major cities by 2011-12	
13.	Environment	To treat all urban waste water by 2011-12 to clean river waters	
14.	Environment	To increase energy efficiency by 20 percentage points by 2016-17. (Energy Intensity)	

NEW INDICATORS (TOTAL = 13):

S.No.	TARGET CATEGORY (according to XII Plan)	XI PLAN	XII PLAN
1.	Economic Growth		Manufacturing growth rate of 10 per cent
2.	Economic Growth		Every State must have a higher average growth rate in the Twelfth Plan than that achieved in the Eleventh Plan
3.	Education		Mean Years of Schooling to increase to 7 years by the end of the Twelfth Five Year Plan
4.	Infrastructure		Increase investment in infrastructure as a percentage of GDP to 9 per cent by the end of the Twelfth Five Year Plan
5.	Infrastructure		Increase the Gross Irrigated Area from 90 million hectare to 103 million hectare by the end of the Twelfth Five Year Plan
6.	Infrastructure		Provide electricity to all villages and reduce AT & C losses to 20 per cent by the end of the Twelfth Five Year plan
7.	Infrastructure		Upgrade National and State highways to the minimum two-lane standard by the end of the Twelfth Five Year plan
8.	Infrastructure		Complete Eastern and Western Dedicated Freight Corridors by the end of the Twelfth Five Year plan

S.No.	TARGET CATEGORY (according to XII Plan)	XI PLAN	XII PLAN
9.	Infrastructure		Ensure 50 per cent of rural population has access to 55 LPCD piped drinking water supply and 50 per cent of gram panchayats achieve the Nirmal Gram Status by the end of the Twelfth Five Year plan
10.	Environment		Add 30000 MW of renewable energy capacity in the Twelfth Plan
11.	Environment		Reduce emission intensity of GDP in line with the target of 20 per cent to 25 per cent reduction by 2020 over 2005 levels
12.	Service delivery		Provide access to banking services to 90 per cent Indian households by the end of the Twelfth Five Year plan
13.	Service delivery		Major subsidies and welfare related beneficiary payments to be shifted to a direct cash transfer by the end of Twelfth Plan, using the Aadhar platform with linked bank accounts



Empowered lives.
Resilient nations.

SUMMARY RECORD OF CONSULTATION ON DRAFT BASE PAPER ON STATISTICAL DATA FOR MEASURING MONITORABLE TARGETS

Held on 20th November at the Planning Commission, New Delhi

1. The Consultation on Draft Base Paper on Statistical Data for Measuring Monitorable Targets was held under the Chairmanship of Shri. T K Pandey, Joint Secretary, (State Plans) and National Project Director (NPD)- HDBI project, on 20th November 2012 at Planning Commission, New Delhi. The objective of the consultation was to discuss the base paper, share information about the availability of reliable data to monitor progress on human development targets, provide inputs and comments; and firm up on the next steps. Expert from the various divisions of the Planning Commission and UNDP attended the meeting; and the list of participants is at Annexure I.
2. The Chair & NPD (HDBI project) Shri. Tuhin Pandey welcomed the participants and initiated with a brief introduction to the purpose of the meeting. Ms. Sumeeta Banerji, Assistant Country Director, UNDP also briefed the participants on the draft base paper submitted by the Consultant, and tabled for discussions. The Consultant was requested by the Chair to present the findings as presented in the base paper on the availability of data regarding monitorable targets at National and State levels. The data indicators for each target were discussed by the group and inputs were provided regarding data availability, source, periodicity of updation/frequency, etc. The participants agreed that for some data points clarifications needs to be provided by the concerned Ministries.
3. The following is a summary of the main observations from the discussion:
 - 3.1 **Targets in the 12th Plan:** Monitorable targets for the 12th Plan are available, and will be finalized after the NDC meeting to be held on 29 December 2012. In its current form, the 12th Plan has National targets and only three State targets (as opposed to 13 State targets in the 11th Plan).
 - 3.2 **Purpose of the exercise:** The purpose of this paper, as observed by the Chair & NPD is to assess the availability of data for monitoring development targets to push the human development agenda by making a case for periodic measurement. Therefore, the paper should find out the actual situation in terms of existing data, their sources, frequency of availability of data, and comment on its accuracy and reliability.

This information can then be used by planners for comparing what data is ideally desired and what is available in order to identify gaps and to identify solutions on how to bridge them; define how targets that are not being monitored sufficiently should be monitored; and assign the responsibility for such monitoring to a specific department/body.

- 3.3 **Data management and disclosure/presentation:** At present, the system of data management is decentralised with multiple sources. There needs to be harmonisation of data collection exercises with the planning exercise.
- 3.4 **Comparability, periodicity and disaggregation:** Data comparability is a serious issue that required attention- there is no uniform pattern of collection across States for several indicators and this makes comparison difficult. For example, GSDP (Gross State Domestic Product) data is not comparable across States because although the CSO has trained the concerned officials in the States on collecting data and it is intended to be uniform, some States are at advanced stages of data collection while others get estimated from local bodies. The Planning Commission members present at the meeting confirmed they have a list of States which collect estimates from local bodies and can share that list with the UNDP. Moreover, there is a need for data that is collected at more frequent periodic intervals. For instance, 10 year intervals between the availability of updated information on the child sex ratio are too long and lead to the loss of valuable time during which remedial interventions can be undertaken in high concern States/regions. Therefore, data on such indicators must be updated more frequently. Also, data that is disaggregated by gender and by social groups is necessary in order to plan for inclusive growth. Reliable data that is disaggregated by these groups is at present unavailable for several targets.
- 3.5 **Setting targets:** Adviser, WCD division (Planning Commission) stressed that targets should be aspirational, and not defined in terms of what is felt can be achieved given current circumstances.
- 3.6 **NSSO survey timing:** The quinquennial NSSO surveys will now be conducted in concurrence with every Plan termination year.
- 3.7 **Education data:** Selected Educational Statistics (SES) data was recommended as a source for information on drop outs. The SES data is updated annually, is cohort-based and is not progressive. It was suggested that Net Enrolment Ratio (NER) data be taken from the District Information System for Education (DISE), which is a reliable and holistic source of data. However, it was noted that even the DISE suffers from some issues- for example, a lot of private institutions do not share data on their enrolment and drop outs. It is expected that with the Right to Education (RTE) Act, regulatory powers will increase and problems regarding availability of information

from private institutions will be ameliorated. It was also recognized that the NER is essentially problematic because a lot of children may be enrolled for classes on paper, but may not be actually attending class. UNDP suggested looking at Net Attendance as an alternative, but the feasibility of this is still to be deliberated upon.

- 3.8 The Chair expressed concern regarding determining the number of 'out-of-school' children. Child tracking, as done in the State of Orissa, was an option that was discussed but this was also deemed problematic considering the vast number of unregistered births and the difficulty in deciding at what point (age) tracking should begin. Periodicity of data updation was again cited as a key concern here, especially with regard to data on literacy which is only available every ten years when the Census is conducted. In response to this concern, the group agreed NSSO data could be used for intermediate years, as the NSS is conducted every five years.
- 3.9 **Data v/s legislation:** The group noted that there is a tension between data and legislation, where data that provides evidence of the persistence of certain outlawed practices (example, sharecropping) is sometimes obliterated from official records in order to present progress.
- 3.10 **Suggestion on framing targets:** ACD, UNDP suggested that if agreeable, the Planning Commission could frame monitorable targets for the next Plan period based on the availability of data. This would make measurement of targets easier. However, the members present disagreed with this, as they said that monitoring targets should be decided based on what are considered indicators of human development, and the data to monitor them should consequently be tracked and generated.
- 3.11 **Health data:** Infant Mortality Rate (IMR) and Maternal Mortality Rate (MMR) can be accessed from the District Level Household and Facility Survey (DLHS) 4. The National Family Health Survey (NFHS) -4 will give data upto the State level. The DLHS will be phased out after the fourth round and from there on the NFHS will provide data for both State and district levels. The NFHS will be conducted after every three years. The Annual Health Survey (AHS) is at present being conducted only for the eight Empowered Action Group (EAG) States. Even this will be discontinued after the release of NFHS-4. Some participants expressed an interest in having the AFS scaled up so that reliable indicators on these key indicators on the area of health can be attained on an annual basis for more States. As an alternative, the Sample Registration System (SRS) data was named as a good source of annual State level data for IMR and MMR. The Health Management Information Systems (HMIS) websites of each State were discussed but considered unreliable as a source of data as they do not have data on private institutions. Participants pointed out that if the DISE was able to bring together information from public and (some if not all) private institutions for education, there should be a mechanism for this to be done for the health sector as well.

- i. Malnutrition data is to be taken from DLHS-4 which will be available by the end of 2013, after which the NFHS will continue to provide this information. Some members of the group also expressed an interest in having sex-disaggregated data on malnutrition in the DLHS and NFHS, in order to highlight trends.
 - ii. For data on Anaemia, the most recent source of available data is the DLHS-3, and the next available data will be NFHS-4.
 - iii. The group was informed that the target relating to availability of clean drinking water has been removed from the 12th Plan.
- 3.12 **Comparability of NFHS and DLHS data:** Data from the NFHS and DLHS are regarded as being comparable.
- 3.13 **Targets related to women and children:** Of the three targets relating specifically to women and children, the first, i.e. data on sex ratio is to be collected from the Census. The second target on ensuring that women and girl children comprise 33 percent of the direct and indirect beneficiaries for all government schemes was reported to have been dropped from the 12th Plan. It was observed that the third target i.e. 'ensuring that all children enjoy a safe childhood, without any compulsion to work' is an outcome, not a target. The Chair insisted that even if this target was to be seen in relation to child labour, it should have been articulated as a measurable indicator because such loosely defined indicators leave room for tactful discretion to be employed in the presentation of facts, thereby allowing for misrepresentation of the real picture and being counter-productive to the purpose of this exercise.
- 3.14 **Link between monitorable targets and Results Framework Documents (RFDs) of Ministries:** UNDP asked the Planning Commission whether there was a link between monitorable targets and the RFDs of various Ministries. NPD noted that this would be an interesting subject for research, comparisons between the targets in the Plan documents to the RFDs of relevant Ministries would reveal the degree of consonance in plans, targets and activities.
- 3.15 **Data on Infrastructure:** With regard to data sources on electricity, the consultant was advised to take into account how many villages have been electrified by programmes of the Ministry of Power and Ministry of New and Renewable Energy (MNRE) at the centre, and programmes of the various the State governments. For data on road connections as well, the consultant was asked to take into account State initiatives. Also, it was observed that the target on road connection required revision in the 12th Plan. Data on provision of homestead sites may also benefit from information on census data on houselessness.

4. Concluding remarks

- 4.1 The Chair informed that the consultant would be provided with the 12th Plan targets as soon as possible so that similar exercise could be conducted for the XII Plan.
- 4.2 The consultant was advised to share the draft base paper with concerned officials of the relevant Ministries, and then directly contact them for their views and required information on data sources. During these meetings with Ministry officials, the consultant could also enquire whether any efforts are underway to improve data availability and quality. The Planning Commission will write a letter of introduction for the consultant to present at the Ministries for access.
- 4.3 It was suggested that a consultation be organized in order to discuss how the 12th Plan targets can be monitored, so that data sources can be identified and tracked from the very beginning. Chair mentioned that once the targets are developed, indicators need to be developed as well, so this will take time.
- 4.4 Assistant Country Director, UNDP suggested that the consultant should add columns for data that is disaggregated by sex and social groups in the matrices that he has already prepared.
- 4.5 UNDP further suggested that a small informal advisory group be formed to guide the monitoring of targets under the 12th Plan, including experts such as Dr. N.C. Saxena, officials from the Ministry of Statistics and Programme Implementation (MoSPI), Central Statistics Office (CSO), and other relevant people who act as data points or subject resource persons in different ministries. NPD informed the group that there is already a formal structure in place at the Planning Commission for this purpose in the form of a High Power Committee.
- 4.6 It was decided that the base paper, once finalized, will be presented to the High Power Committee for their inputs.
- 4.7 The Chair observed that discipline, methodology and assigning responsibility to an institution are critical to ensuring proper monitoring of targets and the availability of reliable data. He also mentioned that it is essential that the responsible institutions be fully trained and be given the powers required to ensure that they are able to access/collect data. These nodal institutions should ensure data quality while using the services of local State and district universities or other data collection agencies, by exercising control over their methodology and data management processes, in order to be able to generate reliable data and own the results.

5. Key Action Points

- i. Planning Commission to write to other Ministries introducing the Consultant so that data can be procured and discussion held.
- ii. Consultant to update the paper based on feedback received from the Planning Commission.
- iii. Planning Commission to share the XII Plan Targets once approved so that the Consultant could base the paper on the XII Plan targets.

The meeting concluded with a Vote of Thanks to the Chair.



Planning Commission
Sansad Marg, New Delhi - 110001
www.planningcommission.nic.in



*Empowered lives.
Resilient nations.*

United Nations Development Programme
55 Lodhi Estate, Post Box No. 3059, New Delhi - 110003, India
email: info.in@undp.org, website: www.in.undp.org